

Since 1971



AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND SERVICES FOR SURVIVORS Peel Institute on Violence Prevention Family Services of Peel

APRIL 2018

Table of Contents

INTRO	DDUCTION	2
PART	1: HUMAN TRAFFICKING	3
	Definitions of Human Trafficking	3
	Prevalence of Human Trafficking	4
	Perspectives on Human Trafficking	6
	Causes of Human Trafficking	9
	Impact of Human Trafficking	10
	Victims of Human Trafficking	11
	Gender and Human Trafficking	13
	Race, Ethnicity and Human Trafficking	14
	Socio-economic status and Human Trafficking	17
	Approaches to the Treatment of Human Trafficking	18
PART 2: SURVIVOR NEEDS IN HUMAN TRAFFICKING SERVICES		20
	Legal Needs	20
	Physical needs	21
	Psychological/Health needs	22
	Housing needs	24
PART	3: GAPS IN HUMAN TRAFFICKING SERVICES	26
	Services for Human Trafficking: Issues and Challenges	26
	Challenges in Victim Identification for Human Trafficking	29
	The Role of Professionals in relation to Human Trafficking	30
	Recommendations to Combat Human Trafficking in the Future	32

INTRODUCTION

A. Purpose

This annotated bibliography has been compiled to serve as a review of the literature on Human Trafficking, specifically relating to trafficking for the purposes of sex work. It concerns the needs of survivors and the gaps that exist in available services and programs. It conveys information and ideas on Human Trafficking that have been published by researchers over the past 10 years. This information will be used for the selection and review of bibliographic items.

These annotations will expand trafficking knowledge of researchers in the field and can be used to inform future program implementation and social services for victims. Selected bibliographic items will also be used to complement on-going work by the Institute on Violence Prevention.

B. Focus and Scope

The annotated bibliography will be used for the selection and review of literature in the following areas:

- Human Trafficking
- Needs of Survivors of Human Trafficking
- Gaps in Human Trafficking Services

The focus will be on human trafficking definitions, the impact of human trafficking on victims, the gaps in services for survivors, current and past human trafficking screening tools, and evidence-based prevention and reintegration programs. The scope of the annotated bibliography is to highlight the main findings, strengths and weaknesses of each article, as well as its significance to the principal investigation.

C. Sources Consulted

The literature review is composed of the following: Books, articles (academic, community-based), government reports, websites, films/videos, blogs and vlogs. Articles were collected from six (6) databases: Google Scholar, CINAHL, ProQuest, Scholars Portal, EBSCO and PubMed. Search terms included: Human Trafficking, needs, services, mental health, physical health, men OR women, peer-to-peer support, moral support, gaps, screening tools, and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). Articles were selected based on search terms used. Papers significant to the formal review were selected.

D. Limitations

Only peer-reviewed articles and grey literature that:

- Explored human trafficking, the needs of victims of human trafficking, the services in place to help these victims, and the aspects missing from these services
- Discussed peer-to-peer support methods
- Focused on global, North American, and local perspectives
- Dealt with trafficking for the purposes of sex work
- Were written in English
- Were published between the years 2007 and 2018

Articles that did not meet these criteria were excluded.

PART I: HUMAN TRAFFICKING

A. Overview

This section of the annotated bibliography covers general information on the prevalence and scope of human trafficking on local, national, and international levels. It covers characteristics of victims and current approaches that support survivor recovery and well-being.

B. Annotated Bibliography

1. Definitions of Human Trafficking

Barret N. (2013) An Assessment of Sex Trafficking in Canada. *Canadian Women's Foundation*. Retrieved from https://www.canadianwomen.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/09/NB-Nov-14-FINAL-REPORT-Assessment-of-sex-Trafficking-in-Canada.pdf

This report reviews the overall prevalence of human trafficking in Canada and highlights specific areas of concern, such as internet use in the promotion of human trafficking. The paper examines the techniques used by traffickers and provides information on who is likely to be victimized. The report is divided into ten sections: Introductory material, methodology of the report, challenges to care, incidence rates in Canada, victim profiles, demand for trafficking in Canada, use of internet, economic costs, research gaps and current conclusions. A major strength of this report is that it explores new areas in the discussion of human trafficking, such as the use of online sources in facilitating sexual exploitation. This material can be used to inform policy and law enforcement. The report focuses exclusively on sex trafficking of girls and women in Canada. It fails to include male trafficked victims who are often ignored. Nonetheless, this report can be used to develop an anti-trafficking strategy in Canada and to increase the awareness of human trafficking on a national level.

Gozdiak, E. M, & Bump, M. N. (2008). *Data and research on human trafficking: Bibliography of research-based literature*. Washington, DC: Diane Publishing.

This research report provides a comprehensive bibliography on human trafficking using English language research-based literature found on EndNote, an electronic bibliography program. Search terms were used to narrow down studies of interest. Articles found were organized into categories based on a taxonomy developed by the National Institute of Justice on human trafficking. Findings reveal several research gaps and limitations in the literature surrounding human trafficking. First, little evidence-based research has been done on human trafficking, despite increased interest and known prevalence of the issue. Second, most methodologies incorporated unrepresentative samples, or conducted interviews with small samples that ended up being generalized. Third, few studies employed a qualitative approach, due to limited access to trafficked victims who are willing to participate. While more information is needed on effective policies, practices, and programs that can be implemented to promote recovery, the research report provides relevant information on the current status of human trafficking literature. It highlights the need for greater research to better address the growing problem of human trafficking.

Kidane, W. (2011). Understanding human trafficking and its victims. *Seattle Journal for Social Justice*, *9*(2), 537-548.

This article provides general information on human trafficking, including the causes, prevalence and exploitation of victims of trafficking. The author clarifies the difference between "old slavery" and "modern day slavery" in relation to human trafficking. The author discusses the criminalization of exploiting persons against their will. The article sheds light on the growing problem of trafficking and identifies the challenges of preventing future occurrences. These challenges include deprivation of human rights and lack of national

security. The article argues in support of uniform treatment of trafficked victims both internationally and domestically, and the need to improve services to meet the needs of survivors. Although little information is provided on how organizations can improve policies to promote the well-being of trafficked persons, this report can be used as an informative piece to develop effective solutions to end the trafficking cycle.

Panigabutra-Roberts, A. (2012). Human trafficking in the United States. Part I. State of the knowledge. *Behavioral & Social Sciences Librarian*, *31*(3), 138-151.

The paper examines different forms of trafficking and evaluates the occurrence of human trafficking in the United States. The article provides general information on human trafficking to raise awareness of trafficking knowledge to public members. The article is a two-part project. The first section is composed of background information on human trafficking and its origins. In the second portion, the authors analyze government web sources on trafficking and examine the data provided from publications. Articles were reviewed and collected from the following databases: National Institute of Justice, Thomson Reuter's Web of Knowledge and government reports. Findings revealed there is no accurate data on the occurrence of human trafficking in the United States, due to the hidden nature of the phenomenon. There are gaps in services provided and programs are not meeting the needs of victims. Although the article did not provide much information on how to improve data collection and knowledge gaps in research, the article highlights the need to uncover accurate reports of trafficking, in order to develop effective prevention plans.

Yakushko, O. (2009). Human trafficking: A review for mental health professionals. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling*, *31*(3), 158-167.

The article provides a literature review of human trafficking and a summary of findings from a series of selected articles. The article gives several definitions of human trafficking that have been adopted by different organizations and examines potential causes and processes of trafficking outlined in the literature. It discusses globalization due to increased demand but short supply, leading to cheap labour and commercial sex work. The article evaluates available post-trafficking services and discusses whether recovery programs are meeting the needs of victims. Although little information is provided on how to combat trafficking, the article reveals the need for policy reform and international border control, in order to prevent exploitation and violence against individuals. This informative piece provides an overview of human trafficking, which can raise awareness and inform future services to combat the growing problem.

2. Prevalence of Human Trafficking

Brampton Guardian. (2012). Human trafficking growing in Peel. *South Asian Focus*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.bramptonguardian.com/news-story/6003377-human-trafficking-growing-in-peel/</u>

This newspaper article examines the prevalence of human trafficking in the Region of Peel over the last several years. Interviews were conduced with the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, Peel Regional Police, Ministry of the Attorney General and other community partners who provide support services to trafficked victims. Findings reveal that over half of the human trafficking cases in Canada have occurred in either Brampton or Mississauga. A major strength of this article is found in the increased collaboration between community support services in Peel and the police force. This collaboration has led to developing resources that improve victim identification and increase human-trafficking awareness in the region. Despite developments such as the Counter Human Trafficking Capacity Building Project, to improve education and provide effective interventions for survivors, greater prevention efforts are required to accurately identify victims in community settings, such as hotels, hospitals and other businesses. As well, it is not indicated whether programs have consulted with current trafficked survivors to better serve the needs of victims and provide quality care. Nonetheless, this article sheds light on the growing problem of human trafficking in Peel and offers

suggestions on how officers in the region may address this issue at a local level in partnership with community services.

Elislambouly, D. (2018) Highlights on Human Trafficking Statistics Canada, Ontario and Peel. *Family Services of Peel*. Retrieved from <u>https://fspeel.org/wp-</u>content/uploads/2018/04/Human Trafficking in Canada Ontario and Peel Feb2018.pdf

This document outlines current trends and the prevalence of human trafficking within the Region of Peel in Ontario, Canada. It deals with both domestic and international survivors. Data was collected from government sites such as Statistics Canada, Peel Police, Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) and Justice Canada to obtain demographic information. The paper focuses on women and girls who have been sexually exploited in Canada. Thus, findings cannot be generalized to all trafficked persons in different settings. As well, due to the hidden nature of human trafficking, information in this paper may not accurately reflect the true status of human trafficking in Canada. Nonetheless, the article sheds light on the prevalence of human trafficking at regional, provincial and national levels between 2009 and 2017.

Hodge, D. R. (2008). Sexual trafficking in the United States: A domestic problem with transnational dimensions. *Social Work*, *53*(2), 143-152.

This paper evaluates the prevalence of sex trafficking of young women and children in the United States. It provides information on the current status of human trafficking in the country and increases public knowledge of sex trafficking in America. It investigates techniques implemented by traffickers to recruit victims and shows how sexual services are initiated for commercial purposes. The article discusses legal efforts to protect trafficked victims and the need to protect the human rights of all individuals from exploitation. Furthermore, the article emphasizes the need to improve policies to protect exploited persons and prosecute traffickers to prevent future offences. The Swedish Model, in which prostitution is viewed as a form of sexual violence, was evaluated and argued as to whether it should be employed in U.S. legislation. Although information from this report can be generalized to other populations, the article raises awareness about the prevalence of trafficking in persons and the need to address the growing issue at legal, social and economic levels.

Karam, M. (2014). Trafficking in persons in Canada, 2014. *Statistics Canada*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/85-002-x/2016001/article/14641-eng.htm</u>

The report describes the prevalence of human trafficking in Canada in 2013 and 2014. Data was collected from adult criminal court cases and police reported violations involving human trafficking. Statistics revealed that police-reported trafficking offences doubled from 2013 to 2014 and majority of victims of trafficking reports were young women. Data showed that based on the frequency of trafficking incidents, over 50 per cent of trafficking cases involved another criminal offence. Although little information is provided on efforts from the Canadian legal system to address the growing prevalence of trafficking cases within the nation, the article raises awareness of the growing violation of women and presents information that can be used to inform future prevention efforts.

The Canadian Press. (2017). Two charged in Toronto in international human trafficking case: police. *CTV News.* Retrieved from <u>https://www.ctvnews.ca/canada/two-charged-in-toronto-in-rrrinternational-human-trafficking-case-police-1.3698054</u>

The newspaper article reported on a human trafficking violation case in Toronto, Canada in 2017. The case involved two human traffickers, one man and one woman, both 40 years of age, who have been internationally trafficking victims in Canada since February 2017 and who have been using internet advertisements to lure victims. Trafficking techniques used to coercively gather victims included posting job

opportunities online, and then taking all personal possessions from victims to prevent them from escaping. Specifically, the newspaper article describes the trafficking of a young woman who recently came to Toronto for a job opportunity and was coerced into providing sexual services while providing massage services to clients. The victim was violently choked, and all valuables including money and passport were taken. The victim was discovered when police searched the business and discovered that trafficking was taking place. Although both suspects faced charges and were arrested for sexually exploiting women, no information was provided on police efforts to continue identifying trafficking in the city. Also, it did not discuss whether current anti-trafficking laws and services are effective in promoting the recovery of survivors. Nonetheless, the article sheds light on human trafficking in Toronto and raises public awareness about potential online job advertisements used by traffickers.

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (2018). UNODC on trafficking in persons and smuggling of migrants. *Topics*. Retrieved from http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/humantrafficking/index.html?ref=menuside

The article discusses the prevalence of trafficking in persons in the U.S. and the smuggling of migrants across the border for commercial sex work and labour purposes. The article examines when and how traffickers bring individuals, who are not legal citizens, into the country and exploit them for financial benefit. The article identifies challenges in targeting those who take advantage of others for personal gain and the growing need to protect victims from unimaginable hardships. The article focuses on global action plans and current efforts to combat human trafficking and illegal migration of persons for exploitation purposes. Prevention efforts outlined include the Inter-Agency Coordination Group against Trafficking in Persons. This group strives for better collaboration among United Nations agencies and global partners in preventing human trafficking. Also included is the Smuggling of Migrants Knowledge Portal for the collection of court cases and dissemination of information in relation to trafficking to inform future policies and decision-making. More information is needed to improve victim identification to prevent further smuggling and exploitation. The article raises awareness of the exploitation of this population and the need to prevent further illegal entry and abuse of trafficked persons.

Vicente, P. (2017). Human Trafficking in Peel. *Brampton Focus*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.bramptonfocus.ca/human-trafficking-peel/</u>

The newspaper article describes the increased rates of human trafficking in the Region of Peel and the response of Peel Regional Police to combat growing numbers. The article discusses the risk factors associated with victimization of trafficking and the tactics traffickers employ to recruit young girls. Findings reveal that girls as young as 13 are being targeted and are often blackmailed or threatened by traffickers who pretend to be their boyfriends. Police Chief Jennifer Evans recommended increased communication with young girls on safety and trafficking awareness to prevent further sexual exploitation. Although the article discusses the efforts of regional police to combat the problem, little information is provided on how schools and community programs can become involved and educate youth on human trafficking. In spite of this limitation, the report sheds light on the prevalence of human trafficking in Peel Region and the need to increase awareness among youth and families to reduce victimization.

3. Perspectives on Human Trafficking

Alvarez, M. B., & Alessi, E. J. (2012). Human trafficking is more than sex trafficking and prostitution: Implications for social work. *Affilia*, 27(2), 142-152.

This article evaluates the current discourse of human trafficking in the literature and its implications for social workers at economic, political and individual levels. The article critically examines the complexities associated

with human trafficking at a globalized level and aims to develop a framework grounded in social work values of human rights and social and economic justice. The article discusses the historical roots of human trafficking, organizational perspectives (such as the United Nations and U.S. policies), and assumptions that are often derived from women and children who are sexually exploited. The paper mentions antitrafficking campaigns designed to promote gender equality and reduce discrimination based on class, gender or race. The paper suggests that if social workers better understand the structural inequalities that precede trafficking, they may be able to better identify and comprehensively assess trafficked persons, as well as guide policy makers for prevention. Information is lacking on the inclusion and exclusion criteria for trafficked persons recruited for the study. Limited studies are provided on how social workers can guide policy and practice in relation to human trafficking. Nonetheless, this review provides a useful framework for social workers to actively participate in the discussion of human trafficking and to better aid trafficked persons.

Carter V. (2007) The Thin Line between Prostitution and Trafficking. *Ethics daily: Columns on Culture and Media*. Retrieved from <u>http://www.ethicsdaily.com/the-thin-line-between-prostitution-and-sex-trafficking-cms-23829</u>

This newspaper article discusses how local churches and non-profit organizations are working together to address the growing prevalence of human trafficking within the region. The article distinguishes between prostitution, which is engaging in sexual activity by choice, and sex trafficking, which is an illegal act of engaging in sexual activity by force. The paper discusses the basic needs of victimized women that are currently being unmet in community human trafficking services. It discusses the various ways women have been lured by perpetrators. The article discloses efforts made my local organizations and churches, including The Women's Missionary Union of Virginia, which addresses issues relating to women and children. The organization implemented awareness training, preventative education and involvement opportunities for members of the general public to combat human trafficking. Although the article does not address how the missionary organization plans to implement educational programs, the paper provides relevant information on the impact of human trafficking on women and current preventative efforts to combat this issue in the State of Virginia.

Gajic, V. O., & Stewart, D. (2007). Women trafficked into prostitution: Determinants, human rights and health needs. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, *44*(3), 338-358.

This article examines the cultural and psychosocial determinants of women in human trafficking and reviews the impact of exploitation of women by focusing on mental health outcomes. The document evaluates the definition of trafficking and reviews prevention efforts to combat this issue by examining policies from different countries. The article discusses current barriers that prevent women from escaping from predators and the role of health care providers in facilitating victim identification and assistance. The paper also discusses the legal violation of human trafficking in relation to women's rights and the United Nations Protocol to ensure traffickers' prosecution and victim protection. Although the article mentions differences between countries in combating human trafficking, little information is provided on how countries can better assist foreign-born victims who are trafficked internationally. Nonetheless, this article establishes the importance of organizations working together to best prevent the human trafficking of women. The article provides a realistic evaluation of policy initiatives and encourages organizations to become more involved in assisting victims.

Government of Canada. (2014). Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act. *Justice Law*. Retrieved from <u>http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/AnnualStatutes/2014_25/page-1.html</u>

This article describes the amendment made to the Criminal Code of Canada determined by the Supreme Court of Canada to protect exploited persons and prohibit the purchasing of sexual services in relation to human

trafficking offences. The enactment specifies the prohibition of detaining an individual against their will, the advertising of sexual services on the internet, and the use of weapons to detain someone. As well, the document denounces the purchase of sexual services and exploitation of people for economic interests, to protect human rights of all Canadians. The amendment states the views of the Parliament of Canada toward prostitution and outlines the following as offences by the court: (1) obtaining sexual services for payment or through contractual means, (2) material benefit from sexual services, (3) procuring, and (4) advertising sexual services. All persons involved may be subjected to imprisonment for life to a minimum punishment of imprisonment of a five-year term if they kidnap, physically assault, sexually assault or cause death to a victim during the time of the offence. The article sheds light on the legal protection of exploited persons under the Canadian law. However, the legal protection of foreign victims exploited in Canada is not discussed. Nonetheless, this Act recognizes the legal efforts made by the government to protect all Canadians from sexual exploitation and human trafficking offences.

Lam E. (2016). Anti-Trafficking campaign harms migrant sex workers. *NOW magazine*. Retrieved from <u>https://nowtoronto.com/news/anti-trafficking-harms-migrant-sex-workers/</u>

The newspaper article examines the detainment and deportation of six sex workers from the Asian and Migrant Sex Workers Network, *Butterfly*. The six female sex workers were violently killed. Spectators assumed it was due to emerging anti-trafficking laws. The article argues how anti-prostitution laws are hindering the protection of women who work in the sex industry and how the laws place these women at greater risk of harm. The article challenges the notion of sex work as "unlawful" work and encourages readers to respect the decision of people who willingly participate in this line of occupation. The paper discusses the mistrust sex workers have towards law enforcement, strictly due to the negative perception government officials have towards prostitution. The paper emphasizes that victimization of Asian women in sex work is unique in North America, and that Asian sex workers who travel overseas do not face similar discrimination elsewhere. Although no information is provided on the views of Asian sex workers outside of *Butterfly*, the article raises awareness on how anti-trafficking legislation created to protect exploited persons can negatively impact sex workers. Specifically, the article shows how some women do not identify with the term "victims" of sex work and feel that funds should be put towards creating safe measures for women to partake in sex work as opposed to combatting "human trafficking."

Davidson, J. O. C. (2006). Will the real sex slave please stand up? Feminist review, 83(1), 4-22.

The document explores the definition of human trafficking and the distinction between prostitution and forced participation into commercial sex work. The article challenges the misconception of anti-trafficking protecting victims and securing rights, when laws are limiting those who willingly take part in the sex trade. The author explains the economic benefit society gains from commercial sex work and how those who participate in the sex trade are not all trafficked into it. The article acknowledges the growing prevalence of trafficked persons in the U.S. but disputes the difference between slavery and freedom in relation to sex work. The author critiques the lack of a clear definition of trafficking within the literature, which leads to prejudice and false assumptions about prostitution. The author asserts that women have control over their sex work by setting rules and conditions on which actions will be performed, as well as the cost and length of time of each engagement. Although the article incorporates perspectives of current sex workers and their experiences, little information is provided on sex trade experiences of foreign nationals and whether these women have previous history of childhood abuse. Nonetheless, this article sheds light on varying opinions regarding prostitution in relation to human trafficking and how the sex trade can be liberating for someone, as opposed to being forced labour.

4. Causes of Human Trafficking

Cassels, J. (2017). The 20 Reasons Girls Enter and Stay in the Sex Industry. *Arkenstone* Education. Retrieved from <u>http://johncassells.com/2017/11/20/the-20-reasons-girls-enter-and-stay-in-the-sex-industry/</u>

This document lists 20 common reasons why young girls go into the sex industry and choose not to return home. The article discusses common tactics employed by perpetrators to lure or oppress female victims. It describes risk indicators, such as childhood abuse, contributing to the likelihood of sex industry involvement. The twenty reasons outlined in the document include: Fast money, glamour, intrigue, validation, counterfeit love, false promises, brainwashing, isolation, drugs and alcohol, blame, shame, violence/torture, emotional abuse, threats, trauma bonds, debt bondage, controlled movements, normalization, fear of rejection, and lack of options. Although the article mainly focuses on the gendered nature of human trafficking with a specific focus on girls, the document demonstrates the importance of understanding the roots of victim vulnerability to inform prevention efforts. Overall, the list provides clarity on why young females would purposefully enter the industry and choose not to leave. This information can be used to inform recovery programs, treatment interventions and protection efforts in the field of human trafficking.

Logan, T. K., Walker, R., & Hunt, G. (2009). Understanding human trafficking in the United States. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse, 10*(1), 3-30.

This paper examines the definition of human trafficking, characteristics of victims, and criminalization of trafficking people. The article details the coercive strategies used by traffickers to recruit and exploit individuals, and how victims ultimately become entrapped for sex or physical labour. The article discusses how human trafficking is a form of modern-day slavery and how victims are forced to work in poor conditions, with little to no compensation. Common places where victims were identified are in restaurants, factories, the porn industry and entertainment businesses. Based on previous reports, the paper reveals that many victims remain entrapped due to the following: Shame, confinement, lack of knowledge about alternatives, fear and isolation from friends and family. The article emphasizes the need for the public and for government organizations to become more aware, educated and trained to identify victims to prevent further exploitation and violence. The paper's authors argue for legal actions and policies to protect victims from trafficking and to prosecute traffickers. This article fails to address challenges in post-trafficking services for victims as the first step in providing support. The need for more research in combatting trafficking is indicated. This paper can be used to inform future outreach programs and services for trafficked persons.

Reid, J. A., Huard, J., & Haskell, R. A. (2015). Family-facilitated juvenile sex trafficking. *Journal of Crime and Justice*, *38*(3), 361-376.

This research article investigates the facilitation and prevalence of domestic minor sex trafficking by family members. The study evaluates victim and trafficker characteristics such as history of childhood abuse, relationship patterns, coercive strategies employed and trafficking motivations. Data was collected from patient records of juveniles who were victims of sex trafficking in the State of Florida. Family, victim and trafficker characteristics were compared with non-trafficked victims' records. Findings revealed that juvenile trafficked victims who entered the sex trade from family facilitation had greater maltreatment histories and experienced different types of childhood abuse. Findings from this study cannot be generalized to different populations in other settings, as results were restricted to sexually trafficked youth in Florida. Nonetheless, the study sheds light on the hidden and secret nature of sex trafficking among youth and the need to improve victim identification and health services that assist victim recovery.

5. Impact of Human Trafficking

Cary, M., Oram, S., Howard, L. M., Trevillion, K., & Byford, S. (2016). Human trafficking and severe mental illness: An economic analysis of survivors' use of psychiatric services. *BMC Health Services Research*, *16*(284), 1-8.

This paper reports on the financial costs of mental health services for human trafficking survivors and identifies factors that influence economic costs for service provision in the United Kingdom. Data was extracted from the Centre Case Register Interactive Search (CRIS) to identify 119 patients who experienced human trafficking and accessed mental health services post-trafficking from 2007 to 2012. Records were then analyzed using regression models to identify factors related to mental health service costs. Findings revealed that psychotic disorder diagnosis and experiences of abuse before trafficking were related to higher service costs. The mean total of mental health service cost per patient was £27,293, and the mean duration of service use was 1490 days. The study significantly identified two factors that contributed to high economic costs in treating victims: Pre-trafficking violence and psychotic disorder diagnosis. However, cost estimates were limited to the use of secondary mental health services, so other primary and tertiary health costs were not included. Despite this weakness, the study demonstrates that treatment for survivors of human trafficking requires long-term mental health support, economic welfare, and social provision. This is especially the case for victims who experienced abuse before the trafficking event and, in addition, were diagnosed with a psychotic disorder.

Hossain, M., Zimmerman, C., Abas, M., Light, M., & Watts, C. (2010). The relationship of trauma to mental disorders among trafficked and sexually exploited girls and women. *American Journal of Public Health*, *100*(12), 2442-2449.

This paper analyzes the relationship between trauma and mental health problems among young women and girls who have been sexually exploited through human trafficking. Participants (n=204) from seven different human trafficking services were given the Brief Symptom Inventory and Harvard Trauma Questionnaire to fill out. Pre-trafficking abuse was taken into consideration during multivariate regression model analyses for PTSD, depression and anxiety. Findings reveal that sexual abuse was related to higher levels of PTSD symptoms. Those who experienced both physical and sexual abuse were likely to experience higher levels of depression, PTSD and anxiety. Results also showed that the length of time that victims were trafficked influenced symptomology. Those who were trafficked longer were exposed to greater abuse and thus, were more associated with mental health symptoms, in comparison to those who were trafficked for a shorter time. A strength of this study is that participants came from 12 different countries, ranging from Europe to West Africa and the Caribbean, which provided richer data. Despite the inclusion of pre-trafficking experiences, the factors of sexual violence during trafficking and the amount of time the individual was trafficked had independent effects on participants' symptoms. Nonetheless, this study demonstrates the comorbidity between PTSD, anxiety and depression among trafficked for longer durations.

Oram, S., Khondoker, M., Abas, M., Broadbent, M., & Howard, L. (2015). Characteristics of trafficked adults and children with severe mental illness: A historical cohort study. *Lancet Psychiatry*, *2*(12), 1084-1091.

The paper investigates the mental health status of trafficked people in secondary mental health services in the United Kingdom. It examines the prevalence of depression and post-traumatic stress disorder among victims with severe mental illness. Data was collected from 200,000 electronic patient records and reduced to identify 133 trafficked persons. Information was extracted on patients' demographic characteristics, abuse history and clinical traits. Findings revealed that majority of trafficked persons were female and 68% were children under the age of 18. Results showed that victims had a history of childhood abuse and previously experienced physical or sexual assault. The commonly recorded diagnoses involved adjustment disorder,

affective disorder and post-traumatic stress disorder. Trafficked patients were more likely to be admitted into psychological services than non-trafficked patients and stayed in health programs for longer periods. The study used innovative approaches to collect information on trafficked patients, including electronic records. Little information was provided, however, on effective interventions to support the well-being of victims in clinical settings. Nonetheless, the cohort study illustrated that trafficked persons are related to longer hospital stays and are likely to have experienced greater levels of abuse from pre and post trafficking events.

Oram, S., Stöckl, H., Busza, J., Howard, L., & Zimmerman, C. (2012). Prevalence and risk of violence and the physical, mental, and sexual health problems associated with human trafficking: Systematic review. *PLoS Medicine.*, *9*(5), 1-13.

The systematic review reports on health problems and the risk of violence associated with human trafficking. Specifically, the article examines the prevalence of sexual, physical and mental problems among trafficked groups. Articles were selected from the following databases: PsycINFO, PubMed, Medline and Web of Science, and citations tracked to find additional researcher papers. A total of 19 quality papers were selected and met the criteria for the purpose of the study. All articles focused on the sexual exploitation of young women and girls. Findings revealed that there are high levels of violence and mental health problems among female trafficked victims who have been forced into commercial sex work within the sample. Results are limited by the generalization of findings to different trafficked populations within different settings, and methodological variation between selected papers. Nonetheless, this review suggests that sex trafficking can have a range of negative health implications for victims and can increase the risk of violence. The study emphasizes the need to mitigate the mental and physical health outcomes of trafficked victims and to develop interventions to reduce these risks.

6. Victims of Human Trafficking

Deshpande, N. A., & Nour, N. M. (2013). Sex Trafficking of Women and Girls. *Reviews in Obstetrics and Gynecology*, *6*(1), 22–27.

This article discusses the prevalence of sex trafficking of women and girls in the United States and globally. It examines the social implications of sex trafficking on victims and calls for medical and legal attention to address the needs of victims. The paper offers suggestions to increase prevention efforts such as early victim identification and improved screening processes. Little information is provided, however, on the effectiveness of these prevention efforts and if the needs of victims are truly being met through these protocol modifications. The article provides detailed examples of screening questions that health care workers can use in their practice. As well, it discusses the economic costs of human trafficking in communities such as insurance administration costs or government expenditure to support post-trafficking services. More information is needed on how to better support victims of human trafficking in health care settings. Nonetheless, this article sheds light on the current trends of sex trafficking in the United States and how young women are affected physically, psychologically and socially.

Hopper, E. K. (2017). Polyvictimization and developmental trauma adaptations in sex trafficked youth. *Journal of Child & Adolescent Trauma*, *10*(2), 161-173.

This study explores the history of childhood adversity and poly-victimization among trafficked youth. Data was collected from both foreign national and domestic youth and analyzed using qualitative analysis. Findings revealed that many trafficked youths had previous experiences of physical, verbal and sexual abuse, emotional neglect and family dysfunction. Results showed disruption in mental processes such as impaired self-esteem, altered self-perception, difficulties with establishing interpersonal relationships, emotional dysregulation and impulsivity. The article identifies coercive techniques employed by traffickers and shows how they take

advantage of the vulnerabilities of youth by pretending to meet victims' physical and emotional needs. Although more information is required on whether programs meet the culturally unique needs of foreign national youth, the article provides relevant information on the trafficking of youth and what factors can lead to further victimization, if not identified and treated by mental health professionals. Overall, this article sheds light on the prevalence of polyvictimization among trafficked youth and its impact on developmental trauma adaptations.

McClain, N. M., & Garrity, S. E. (2011). Sex trafficking and the exploitation of adolescents. *Journal of Obstetric, Gynecologic & Neonatal Nursing*, *40*(2), 243-252.

The report discusses the prevalence of human trafficking among the young adolescent population and how this age group is often forced into many different types of labour, particularly sexual exploitation. Researchers evaluated and examined the definition of trafficking in persons and the implications of recruiting minors. The article details the hidden nature of the crime and the challenges of identifying victims in public settings. Findings reveal that adolescents aged 14 to 17 represent the largest percentage of victims trafficked, with 11% of youth prostituting under the age of 14. Studies show that internet websites and online sources are being used to advertise commercial sex services. Youth are being exploited and recruited through these sites, through false promises and manipulative strategies employed by traffickers. The article addresses the clinical implications of sex trafficking of adolescents under the age of 18. It discusses legislation, such as the Victims Protection Act, which provides protection for minors. Studies have shown that exploited minors often develop emotional, sexual and physical trauma from trafficking experiences and face negative mental health outcomes such as depression, PTSD or anxiety. The article provides detailed warning signs and potential screening questions to assist individuals in identifying trafficked victims. However, more information is needed on effective post-trafficking services, and on the efficacy of programs in treating minor victims in different settings. Overall, this article offers effective strategies for post-trafficking organizations to potentially identify trafficked victims and for clinical workers to use in improving the well-being of survivors.

National Center of Safe Supportive Learning Environments. (2017). Risk factors and indicators. *Human Trafficking in American Schools*. Retrieved from <u>https://safesupportivelearning.ed.gov/human-trafficking-americas-schools/risk-factors-and-indicators</u>

The article describes risk factors that make certain individuals vulnerable to trafficking, and it lists behavioural indicators that observers can use to identify victims. Possible risk factors of susceptibility to trafficking include: Isolation, homelessness, poverty, family dysfunction, and substance abuse. Findings reveal that youth from the LGBTQ community are five times more likely than heterosexual youth to be victimized, and this may be due to rejection from peers. The article also highlights warning signs for potential victims of sex trafficking. Behavioural indicators involved: Practiced responses to questions, visible bruises, lack of control over one's daily activities, and inability to attend school, go to work or frequent gatherings. Although no information is provided on what individuals can do once they notice the signs of potential trafficking, information from this article can be used to increase trafficking knowledge and awareness.

National Human Trafficking Hotline (n.d). The victims. *Human Trafficking*. Retrieved from <u>https://humantraffickinghotline.org/what-human-trafficking/human-trafficking/victims</u>

The article identifies the prevalence of human trafficking in the United States and discusses vulnerabilities that lead to increased susceptibility to victimization. The article describes coercive strategies employed by traffickers to recruit victims and the poor conditions victims are forced to withstand in order to survive. Studies reveal that many victims are hidden within factories or brothels and perform commercial sex work in underground markets. One of the largest proportions of trafficked persons are runaway youth. The article explains how homeless youth are most vulnerable to trafficking, due to poor social supports and isolation.

Other risk factors identified in the article include: Domestic violence, sexual assault, social discrimination and childhood abuse. It was found that traffickers approach their victims in public spaces, such as transportation hubs, and compel youth to subject themselves to sexual services, using false promises and feigned affection. The article also discloses the victimization of foreign nationals and the techniques that are employed to recruit them. For example, victims become indebted to traffickers who pretend to help financially with travel expenses, but who then demand sex or forced labour in return. Lacking knowledge regarding local rights and laws, internationally trafficked victims fall under the control and manipulation of perpetrators. The article does not provide information on behavioural indicators to potentially identify victims and provide support. Nonetheless, the document offers relevant information on common traits among trafficked persons that can be used to inform post-trafficking services and increase prevention efforts to combat further exploitation.

Reid, J. A. (2018). Sex trafficking of girls with intellectual disabilities: an exploratory mixed methods study. *Sexual Abuse*, *30*(2), 107-131.

This mixed methods study examines the prevalence of sex trafficking of girls with intellectual disabilities. Data was collected from 15 juvenile sex trafficking cases, and records were compared with juvenile sex trafficking cases of girls without intellectual disabilities. Findings reveal an elevated risk of exploitation in sex trafficking among young girls with intellectual disabilities. Reasons for this increased victimization are due to limited knowledge of sexual relationships, difficulty distinguishing boyfriend from trafficker, and lack of information on how to escape a trafficking situation. The article creates awareness of the prevalence of sexual victimization of intellectually disabled girls and the need to protect this vulnerable population. Limited information is provided on how to increase knowledge of sexual victimization among disabled girls. Nonetheless, the article identifies the need to improve safety measures for young girls with intellectual disabilities and the disproportionate risk for sexual exploitation among this population.

7. Gender and Human Trafficking

Bernat, F., & Winkeller, H. (2010). Human sex trafficking: The global becomes local. *Women & Criminal Justice, 20*(2), 186-192.

This paper examines the gendered nature of human trafficking and the impact of victimization at individual, societal and economic levels. The paper recommends changes from a legal perspective and emphasizes the need for effective political responses to better aid this vulnerable population. Findings reveal that past traumatic experiences and individual trauma impede the recovery of victims accessing support services. As well, more work needs to be done at an organizational level to provide trauma-informed care and facilitate victim cooperation. The study highlights the need for programs to better understand individuals involved, the factors that led to their sexual work, and its impact on their ability to participate in treatment programs. Limited information is available on cultural considerations when working with international victims, and findings cannot be generalized to the entire US population, as response at a local level was mainly analyzed in Arizona. In spite of these findings, this report demonstrates that more work needs to be done at a local level to promote the well-being and identification of human trafficked victims. Social services need to be improved, to better meet the emotional, physical, legal and mental needs of victims.

Covington, S. S. (2008). Women and addiction: A trauma-informed approach. *Journal of psychoactive drugs*, *40*(5), 377-385.

The paper examines addiction treatment and gender-responsive services for women in need of traumainformed care. It addresses the effectiveness of the Women's Integrated Treatment (WIT) model for the treatment of women and girls, and its theoretical foundations in the following: Relational-cultural theory (which identifies women's sense of self in connection to others), addiction theory (which considers the sociopolitical environment of women to understand their addiction) and trauma theory (which is based on trauma-informed services at an organizational level). The author examines the issue of gender in substance abuse treatment and the need to create environments that reflect female realities, to better address women's needs and respond to their strengths and weaknesses to promote recovery. The article offers advice on how to create women-centered services by integrating substance abuse and trauma-informed services. Suggestions include program modification through staff and site selection, program content, service implementation and learning materials. Although the article focuses on the issue of gender, little information is provided on meeting the needs of women from different cultural backgrounds. Nonetheless, the article identifies the need for programs to address environmental factors, such as gender socialization and female inequalities, that impede the recovery and treatment of women and young girls with addiction and trauma histories.

World Health Organization. (2012). Understanding and addressing violence against women: Human trafficking. *Sexual and Reproductive Health*. Retrieved from http://www.who.int/reproductivehealth/topics/violence/vaw_series/en/

The paper reviews the growing prevalence of human trafficking worldwide and examines ways in which women are coerced into different types of labour or sexual exploitation. The document advocates for increased assistance and protection of trafficked victims, especially women and children, and improved policies to prevent further suppression and punishment of survivors. The article defines human trafficking and analyzes the health implications of trafficking for victims, both mentally and physically. The document addresses the need for various sectors, such as the criminal justice system, health services, researchers and policy makers to coordinate together to combat trafficking worldwide. Although the article addresses government obligations regarding the health of trafficked persons, increased awareness and training are needed at local, community, and individual levels to reduce issues of stigma and to increase victim identification. Despite this limitation, the document provides a general overview of human trafficking and can be used as an educational piece on the prevalence of trafficking in persons. It will also serve to increase awareness.

Womankind Worldwide. (2018). Standing with the change makers: Lessons from supporting women's movement. *Policy & Campaigns*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.womankind.org.uk/policy-and-campaigns/resources/standing-with-the-changemakers</u>

The report provides information on the efforts of the Womankind Worldwide organization to advocate and reinforce the rights of women around the world. The document describes the organization's plans to transform the lives of women by fundraising, communicating and supporting women's movements around the globe. The article describes three ways in which the organization plans to advocate for women. These methods include the following: Promoting social change in patriarchal societies where women have little to no power, offering services that provide employment opportunities for women, and implementing policies and laws that protect the rights of women and tackle inequality. Although the article offers solutions for context-specific challenges faced by women in different countries, financial support from various groups, including government officials, is still needed to ensure women's movements for social change in different societies. Information from this article can be applied to different international communities to improve empowerment of women.

8. Race/Ethnicity and Human Trafficking

Arauco, V. P., Gazdar, H., Hevia-Pacheco, P., Kabeer, N., Lenhardt, A., Masood, S. Q., ... & Scalise, E. (2014). Strengthening social justice to address intersecting inequalities post-2015. *Oversea Developmental Institute*

(ODI) Policy Briefing. Retrieved from https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assests/publications-opinion-files/9213.pdf

This paper discusses the causes of exclusion based on identity-based inequalities such as race, ethnicity and culture, which has an impact on how social groups are treated. The report examines relevant policies created to combat social discrimination based on group identification, and it addresses the disadvantages of belonging to devalued identities. The article provides information on current efforts to tackle deeply rooted inequalities. As well, it discusses political projects underway to increase social justice of disadvantaged members in society. Recommendations include social movements to enhance inclusion principles and institutional change through policy reform to reduce inequalities. Information from this report is based on social and political matters in the U.S. that may not be generalized to other countries. Nonetheless, the report sheds light on the need for constitutional change and improved policy formulation to enhance the social well-being of devalued societal members and prevent future generations from experiencing discrimination.

Kiss, L., Pocock, N. S., Naisanguansri, V., Suos, S., Dickson, B., Thuy, D., ... & Borland, R. (2015). Health of men, women, and children in post-trafficking services in Cambodia, Thailand, and Vietnam: an observational cross-sectional study. *The Lancet Global Health*, *3*(3), 154-161.

This cross-sectional study investigates the health status of men, women and children post-trafficking in Cambodia, Thailand and Vietnam. The study employs both qualitative and quantitative methodology. Interviews were conducted with individuals in human trafficking services and participants were given questionnaires to complete. Two questionnaires were administered: the Hopkins Symptoms Checklist and the Harvard Trauma Questionnaire. Data was evaluated to determine mental health outcomes and accounted for variables such as age, length of exploitation and type of trafficking. Findings revealed that 48% of victims experienced physical or sexual abuse, and 35% of women and girls experienced sexual abuse. In regards to mental health outcomes, 61.2% of participants showed symptoms of depression, 42.8% of participants showed symptoms of anxiety and 38.9% of victims showed symptoms of PTSD. A major strength of this study is the large sample size of trafficked people from both sexes of different ages. A major limitation is the restriction of the sample to clients from post-trafficking services, as opposed to trafficked persons in general. Nonetheless, this study demonstrated that violence and poor working conditions during the time in trafficking can contribute to the development of depressive, anxiety or PTSD symptoms among victims. Information from this study can be used to inform decision makers in health services to further support the recovery of this population.

McCauley, H. L., Decker, M. R., & Silverman, J. G. (2010). Trafficking experiences and violence victimization of sex-trafficked young women in Cambodia. *International Journal of Gynecology & Obstetrics*, *110*(3), 266-267.

The report examines the trafficking experiences and violence faced by young women in Cambodia from sex trafficking. Young women who sought post-trafficking services from 26 nongovernmental organizations were recruited for the study. Participants were asked to complete questionnaires on their trafficking experience and health status. Findings revealed that 52.2% of women who were trafficked were under the age of 18, and 3 out of 4 women were trafficked within Cambodia. Reasons listed included parents willingly placing children in commercial sex work or young girls being taken against their will. Many victims were deprived of food, and 48 out of the 73 women with sexual health records, were infected with sexually transmitted diseases. Findings cannot be generalized to all trafficked women, as the study was limited to women in Cambodia who accessed post-trafficking services. Nonetheless, the study illustrates that young women in Cambodia are vulnerable to sex trafficking and those trafficked face serious health implications, ranging from STIs to malnourishment.

Ostrovschi, N. V., Prince, M. J., Zimmerman, C., Hotineanu, M. A., Gorceag, L. T., Gorceag, V. I., ... & Abas, M. A. (2011). Women in post-trafficking services in Moldova: diagnostic interviews over two time periods to assess returning women's mental health. *BMC Public Health*, *11*(1), 232.

The longitudinal study investigates mental distress among trafficking survivors in Moldova, using psychiatric diagnostic assessments. Female participants aged 18 or over from the International Organization for Migration were recruited for the study. Participants took part in structured clinical interviews from the DSM-5 with a psychiatrist, and diagnoses were recorded. A total of 120 women were eligible to take part in the primary investigation. Diagnoses made immediately upon post-trafficking entry (1-5 days after) were compared with diagnoses given a couple months after the trafficking event (2-12 months after). Findings revealed that over 50% of participants met the criteria for at least one DSM-5 diagnosis such as PTSD (16%), anxiety or mood disorder (18%) or co-morbid PTSD (20%). Diagnoses made days after the post-trafficking event were maintained through the 2-12 month follow up in 85% of women. The high rate of psychiatric illness may be attributed to other factors, such as previous abuse history. The paper demonstrates that immediate crisis intervention services is needed for trafficked women following their return in order to mitigate the mental distress that may be prolonged for several months following the event. The article reveals that trafficked women may experience severe psychological distress, and that intervention programs are needed to address the immediate mental health needs of victims to prevent further distress.

Phasha, T. N., & Myaka, L. D. (2014). Sexuality and sexual abuse involving teenagers with intellectual disability: Community conceptions in a rural village of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. *Sexuality and Disability*, *32*(2), 153-165.

The paper examines the factors contributing to the vulnerability of intellectually disabled youth being sexually abused in a rural village in South Africa. Data was collected from two schools located in the region. Face-to-Face interviews were conducted with school staff, social workers and community members (e.g. traditional healer, parents, etc.). Several factors were produced using thematic content analysis. Data revealed six conceptions that led to the sexual abuse of disabled youth: (1) they have a high sex drive in comparison to non-disabled people, (2) they are sexually attractive, (3) they have unusual power, (4) they feel no pain, (5) it is a cure for sexually transmitted diseases and (6) it is a "generous" act to offer some form of intimacy. The article illustrates the consequences and vulnerability of individuals with disabilities. Findings from this study cannot be generalized to other populations in different settings due to the purposive sample drawn from a small rural village in South Africa. Despite this limitation, the paper demonstrates the need to protect youth with intellectual disabilities from abuse and dehumanizing activities. People with disabilities should be viewed as individuals with worth and should be assisted in developing healthy, meaningful relationships.

Robinson, J. (2017). Washington DC: Our Missing Black Girls- Race and Human Trafficking?. *Medium*. Retrieved from <u>https://medium.com/@jessica.robinson9698/washington-dc-our-missing-black-girls-260a746cb360</u>

The article describes the prevalence of missing Black and Hispanic youth in Washington, D.C. and its potential relation to the increase in human trafficking. The article details the victimization of women of colour in human trafficking in the United States and the discriminating role that race plays in vulnerability to exploitation. The article explores the historical racialized sexual exploitation of women of colour based on societal beliefs and the use of young adults for commercial sex. The author, CEO and cyber security consultant at PurePoint International, emphasizes the need to protect vulnerable groups in the community and the importance of improving policy legislation to ensure prosecution of traffickers who exploit children. Although no information is provided on how community members can identify trafficked victims, the article raises awareness of the prevalence of human trafficking in the United States and potential risk factors that may contribute to the

vulnerabilities of victims in human trafficking. The article sheds light on the role race plays in the commercial sex industry and in violence victimization.

The National Inquiry into Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls. (2017). Interim report: Our women and girls are scared. *Privy Council Office*. Retrieved from <u>http://www.mmiwg-ffada.ca/files/ni-mmiwg-interim-report-en.pdf</u>

The interim report investigates the missing and murdered indigenous women and girls, also known as the National Inquiry, to expand prevention efforts and protect women from further exploitation. The report examines current legislation and policies established that have devalued the lives of Indigenous people and the lack of social laws in protecting this group. Interviews were conducted with survivors and their relatives to determine ways to improve safety measures and to ensure the well-being of Indigenous women. Findings revealed there is a great need for importance and value to be placed on the lives of Indigenous people, who have often been ignored and neglected in Canadian law. The article discusses the unresolved trauma Indigenous people experience from past positions of authority in Canada and the need for social justice for families and communities who are still suffering. Findings from this study cannot be generalized to other minority populations. The article, however, raises awareness of violence in Canada against Indigenous women and the need for national change to ensure social justice. The report highlights the growing prevalence of violence against Indigenous people, especially women, and the need for further national efforts to ensure the well-being and protection of this population.

9. Socio-economic Status and Human Trafficking

Charron, M. (2009). *Neighbourhood characteristics and the distribution of police-reported crime in the city of Toronto*. Ottawa, ON: Statistics Canada, Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics.

The research paper examines the relationship between crime rates in the City of Toronto and neighborhood characteristics to determine the spatial distribution of police-reported crimes in the area. Data on police-reported crimes was collected from a crime reporting survey in 2006, and neighborhood characteristics were collected from Statistics Canada. Findings from this study reveal that local characteristics, such as the social economic status of residents, influence crime levels, and that crime is not randomly dispersed but concentrated in areas with certain characteristics. Crime reporting was influenced by residents' willingness to involve the police and to rely on law enforcement. Data from these sources was used to identify the characteristics in common among neighborhoods that are associated with crime levels. A major strength of this study is that it can help in identifying contextual factors associated with elevated crime rates. A limitation to this study is that findings cannot be generalized to other urban areas in Canada, as data collection was limited to Toronto, Ontario. Nonetheless, this research paper provides useful information that can be used to inform crime reduction strategies in the Toronto area and promote community safety among residents.

Riutort, M., Rupnarain, S., & Masoud, L. (2016). Framework on anti-racism, anti-oppression and Equity: Factoring the determinants of health and persisting inequities in services delivered for survivors of violence in Canada. *Family Service of Peel*.

The report presents social determinants of health services provided to victims of exploitation in Canada and how each social determinant can impact victims on physical, emotional, spiritual and mental levels. Each societal factor was examined on how they influence the distribution of resources among victims and shape economic well-being at local, national and global levels. Several societal factors were identified: Socio-economic status, race, age, gender, education, sexual orientation, religion, language and disability/ability. Findings revealed that no single social determinant is more strongly linked to violence against women, but rather multiple factors contribute to greater risk of experiencing domestic violence. Results showed that

racism and sexism are strong social factors that influence job prospects and income. These factors have a negative impact on physical and mental health. More information is needed on the role health organizations play in preventing further social inequality and in promoting the well-being of victims in need in the community. Nonetheless, the article evaluates the intersection between each social factor paired with another to determine its influence on risk for victimization among women exposed to violence. The paper demonstrates that in order to provide more equitable services for the needs of each person, an understanding of the relation between social determinants of health and violence is needed.

10. Approaches to the Treatment of Human Trafficking

Bisson, J. I., Ehlers, A., Matthews, R., Pilling, S., Richards, D., & Turner, S. (2007). Psychological treatments for chronic post-traumatic stress disorder: Systematic review and meta-analysis. *The British journal of psychiatry*, *190*(2), 97-104.

This systematic review and meta-analysis evaluate several psychological treatments for chronic posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD). Treatment options include: Group cognitive-behavioral therapy, traumafocused cognitive behavioral therapy (TFCBT), stress management, and eye desensitization and reprocessing (EMDR) and others. A total of 38 studies that met methodological criteria for randomized controlled trials were selected and examined for the systematic review. Articles were selected from the databases of: Medline, PsycINFO, CINAHL and EMBASE. Results showed that EMDR, TFCBT, stress management and group-cognitivebehavioral therapy reduced PTSD symptoms in comparison with treatment-as-usual and waitlist groups. Findings revealed that not all psychological treatments for PTSD are effective in treating chronic PTSD, and the most effective for those diagnosed is a trauma-focused approach (TFCBT or EMDR). The study demonstrates the effectiveness of trauma-focused psychological interventions used as second-line. The randomized controlled trials reported for the study often showed unadjusted means for the treatment groups post-treatment and for follow-up, and sample sizes were small. Nonetheless, this paper suggests that traumafocused treatments such as TFCBT or EMDR are effective in treating chronic PTSD, and more information is needed on the combined effectiveness of both psychological and pharmacological treatments.

Doherty, S., Oram, S., Siriwardhana, C., Abas, M. (2016). Suitability of measurements used to assess mental health outcomes in men and women trafficked for sexual and labour exploitation: A systematic review. *Lancet Psychiatry*, *3*(5), 464-471.

This systematic review evaluates the mental health assessment tools used for victims of human trafficking to determine the validity and reliability of instruments. A literature review was conducted using the following databases: PsycINFO, Ovid Medline, PubMed, Web of Science, Google Scholar and Global Health. A total of seven articles were selected for the purpose of this review: Three studies used the Harvard Trauma Questionnaire (HTQ) and PTSD checklist (PCL), two studies used the Center for Epidemiological Studies Depression Scale (CES-D) and Hopkins Symptom Checklist (HSCL), whereas only one study used diagnostic manual (DSM) and conducted a semi-structured interview with participants. Findings revealed that few tools were shown to be validated or reliable for trafficked persons. Little information was provided on the rational for tool choice and pilot testing. Further evaluation is needed to determine the appropriateness of instruments in screening and assessing trafficking persons. Nonetheless, this systematic review sheds light on the validity and reliability of assessment tools for trafficked victims, which can be used to inform mental health providers.

Hickle, K. E., & Roe-Sepowitz, D. E. (2014). Putting the pieces back together: A group intervention for sexually exploited adolescent girls. *Social Work with Groups*, *37*(2), 99-113.

This paper deals with a pilot group intervention for domestic minor sex trafficking. The pilot study focuses on the areas of increasing public education, reducing shame, promoting mutual aid and emotion management skills to promote coping. The pilot study is based on a group intervention program for domestic minors in sex trafficking called Putting the Pieces Back Together. The paper discusses the efficacy of the 12-week program and its ability to promote coping skills and recovery among youth. Findings revealed that youth involved in sex trafficking often had a previous history of child maltreatment, sexual abuse, emotional abuse, drug and alcohol abuse, poverty and running away from home. Results showed that the pilot group intervention was effective in settings where mental health professionals were well-educated on sex trafficking and were able to facilitate a safe environment for peers to disclose experiences. The group intervention was able to address trauma symptomology and can be easily modified for different settings. Although little information is provided on the effects of sex trafficking on minors and the need to address the mental and physical impact of trafficking among this vulnerable population.

Lloyd, R. (2008). From victim to survivor, from survivor to leader. *Girls Educational & Mentoring Services*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.gems-girls.org/WhitePaper.pdf</u>

The report examines the importance of leadership programs and opportunities for young women and girls who have been exploited and trafficked for sex work. The report details the impact of leadership programming on young girls' lives by providing a safe, non-judgmental space for individuals to disclose their experiences and share their insecurities. Leadership programs were shown to help young girls develop confidence and improved self-worth. Those who took part in leadership opportunities were able to regain their self-esteem and develop positive self-perception that was previously negative. Leadership programs were developed by the Girls Educational and Mentoring Services (GEMS) for female survivors of human trafficking and were designed to equip young women with the skills and confidence needed to become leaders. Activities involved: Public speaking, running art programs and peer mentorship. Young women and girls were shown to become more assertive and to develop transferrable skills with practical applications. Participants in GEMS benefited from seeing survivors in leadership and mentoring positions, as well as from receiving peer support. Young women and girls were viewed by peers as leaders, as opposed to being viewed as victims, and the program promoted female empowerment. Little information is provided on the effectiveness of GEMS outside of North America. Nonetheless, this program is suitable in promoting leadership qualities and restoring confidence in young women and girls post-trafficking.

Le, J. (2012). Taking steps to counter human trafficking. *Mississauga News*. Retrieved from https://www.mississauga.com/news-story/3125559-taking-steps-to-counter-human-trafficking/

The newspaper article discusses prevention efforts by the Sexual Assault/Rape Crisis Centre of Peel to combat human trafficking in the region. The article describes the Counter Human Trafficking Capacity Building Project, implemented by community partners, together with Peel Regional Police and the Ministry of the Attorney General, to support trafficked victims. The article highlights the prevalence of human trafficking in Canada and the need to improve post-trafficking services to support the well-being and health of victims. Findings revealed that 80% of trafficked persons are young women and girls, and 50% are minors under the age of 18. The one-year project was designed to educate community members on human trafficking and to provide effective treatment interventions for survivors, particularly those forced into commercial sex work. No information is provided on whether the project supported male or older victims of trafficking. Nonetheless, this project can be used to build confidence and to expand trafficking knowledge in stakeholders who are often exposed to victims in public settings.

Potocky, M. (2010). Effectiveness of services for victims of international human trafficking: An exploratory evaluation. *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies, 8*(4), 359-385

The article evaluates the delivery of a post-human trafficking service for undocumented immigrants in the United States who were internationally trafficked. Data was collected from interviews with clients who participated in the program and from patients' chart reviews that were created by staff. A total of 43 clients took part in the study. In addition, clients were assessed to determine health outcomes in mental health, education, employment status, life skills, immigration status and English-speaking ability. Findings revealed that the program helped improve clients' status and abilities in some areas, despite limited resources available. Although the article on the status of internationally trafficked persons is limited to one post-trafficking service for foreign born nationals, the paper gives recommendations on future evaluations and improvements of program delivery. This article sheds light on challenges experienced by undocumented immigrants when accessing post-trafficking services and the need to improve service delivery to enhance recovery and well-being.

Wirsing, K. E. (2012). Outreach, collaboration and services to survivors of human trafficking: The Salvation Army STOP-IT program's work in Chicago, Illinois. *Social Work & Christianity*, *39*(4), 466-480.

The document describes the development of a program called STOP-IT, created by the Salvation Army to combat human trafficking in Chicago. The article examines the program's efficacy in assisting the recovery of victims and discusses whether outreach services help survivors regain independence. The program offers educational training programs on trafficking for community groups and health care providers. As well, the program has implemented a 24-hour hotline to provide referral sources for trafficked victims. It works in collaboration with law enforcement agencies to assist victims. Although the STOP-IT program is client-directed to ensure the program meets the needs of victims, the program is not able to meet housing needs which is one of the immediate needs of trafficked survivors. To help solve this problem, program directors work closely with homeless shelters and child welfare systems to identify safe places for victims to live. Despite this limitation, the STOP-IT program in Chicago has been proven to provide timely and comprehensive services to survivors of human trafficking.

PART II: NEEDS OF SURVIVORS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING SERVICES

A. Overview

This section of the annotated bibliography identifies the needs of survivors of post-trafficking services and examines whether those needs are currently being met in services provided. The following needs were identified: Legal support, physical support, psychological support and housing support.

B. Annotated Bibliography

1. Legal Needs

Clawson, H. J., Small, K. M., Go, E. S., & Myles, B. W. (2003). *Needs assessment for service providers and trafficking victims*. Fairfax, VA: Caliber.

This report details the conducting of a national needs assessment of service providers and human trafficking victims in the United States in 2001. Information from this report was collected to inform justice programs on the current trends of human trafficking and to improve the design of programs which aid trafficked persons. The report evaluates whether the needs of trafficked victims and service providers are being met and offers recommendations on how organizations can improve program responsiveness and delivery. Multiple methods were employed to collect data. Methods involved 98 telephone surveys with service providers and focus groups with 6 victims and 20 health professionals. Findings revealed the greatest needs of sex trafficked victims were: Legal, medical and referral services. The greatest needs identified by service providers included:

Translation services for international victims, financial support for victims without welfare benefits, legal assistance for trafficker prosecutions, and provider training to meet the needs of victims. Due to travel limitations and financial constraints, other research methods, such as face-to-face interviews or on-site visits, could not be conducted. As well, the sample was not representative, so findings cannot be generalized to all trafficked persons. Nonetheless, information from this national assessment can be used to address service barriers and to improve program delivery for both providers and victims. The report sheds light on significant barriers that are faced by victims and providers from legal, social and health perspectives. The document offers legal resources, such as the Trafficking Victims Protection Act, to facilitate service provision during legal proceedings or to fund training workshops for health professionals to better serve victim needs.

Orme, J., & Ross-Sheriff, F. (2015). Sex trafficking: Policies, programs, and services. *Social Work, 60*(4), 287-294.

The article critically examines current anti-trafficking policies, trafficking programs and services available for victims. Authors discuss problems with policies regarding the criminalization of trafficking within the justice system, and the need to implement legislation to ensure the prosecution of traffickers and the protection of survivors. The article evaluates the efficacy of treatment programs for victims post-trafficking and the gap in services which fails to meet the needs of both domestic and internationally trafficked persons. Information is provided on the definition and prevalence of human trafficking worldwide. Authors discuss various psychosocial interventions and assessments that can be implemented at individual, family, or community levels to manage the well-being of survivors. Service improvements to strengthen the provision of care involve prevention programming for social workers and the development of organization protocols to adhere to trauma-focused care and anti-trafficking movements. The article fails to address the complications in meeting service needs and providing legal protection for foreign born nationals. Nonetheless, this paper highlights the importance of improving policies, programs and services for trafficked victims. The article mentions current efforts to combat human trafficking and offers recommendations on services that can be implemented to promote the recovery of survivors.

Santos, B. D. S., Gomes, C., & Duarte, M. (2010). The sexual trafficking of women: Representations of illegality and victimisation. *RCCS Annual Review*. *A selection from the Portuguese journal Revista Crítica de Ciências Sociais*, (2).

This article discusses the legal framework of sexual trafficking of women at a local level. The article examines the emerging unmet needs of trafficked women and current anti-slavery legislation enforced in Portugal. Policies that were implemented to prevent exploitation and promote women's liberation were analyzed and reviewed. The paper discusses preconceptions of women in sex trafficking and the implications of those labels on policies and law enforcement. Findings reveal that the prevalence of foreigners in commercial sex work is increasing in Portugal, and the current Penal Code is insufficient to prevent the occurrence of sexual trafficking. Although the article indicates high incidence rates of human trafficking, efforts to prevent sexual exploitation are not reflected in the country's penal legislation or in public policies. The paper recommends that governments create and reinforce declarations to support human rights of trafficked persons.

2. Physical Needs

Busch-Armendariz, N. B., Nsonwu, M. B., & Cook Heffron, L. (2011). Human trafficking victims and their children: Assessing needs, vulnerabilities, strengths, and survivorship. *Journal of Applied Research on Children: Informing Policy for Children at Risk*, 2(1), 3.

This manuscript investigates the social service needs of trafficked persons and their immigrant children. Nine female participants aged 18 and older who were trafficked in the US, who received refugee social services,

and who have children, were recruited for the study. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with each participant and analyzed to produce several overarching themes. Findings revealed four broad themes related to the needs of trafficked parents and children: (1) basic communication and initial service needs (e.g. desire to contact family and relatives), (2) long-term needs (e.g. medical health), (3) self-efficacy (e.g. finding employment) and (4) looking forward (e.g. future personal goals). This article focuses on the specific needs of victims and their children. The article can be used to inform practice and policy in the field of human trafficking services. However, a major limitation in this study was the use of a purposive, non-probability sample to collect data. Due to this, findings cannot be generalized to all trafficked mothers and their children. Nonetheless, this qualitative study provides important insight into the needs of trafficked mothers and their children. This insight can be used to improve program implementation and strengthen service delivery of human trafficking interventions.

Davy, D. (2015). Understanding the support needs of human trafficking victims: A review of three human trafficking program evaluations. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 1(4), 318-337.

This document identifies the needs of trafficked persons and examines whether support needs are being met in available services. The article evaluates the effectiveness of services by conducting a program evaluation of three human trafficking services in the U.S. Findings reveal that current services are insufficient in meeting the needs of victims, and further evaluation is needed to ensure that services are effectively serving trafficked victims. The author offers suggestions for programs to collaborate with other services to increase treatment efficacy and the formation of standardized protocols to promote survivor recovery and increase adherence to trauma-informed care. Further program evaluation is needed nation-wide through the means of metaanalyses or longitudinal studies. Nonetheless, this paper provides information on the status of victims in human trafficking services and the need to improve support programs to better address the needs of victims.

Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., Yun, K., Roche, B., Morison, L., & Watts, C. (2006). Stolen smiles: a summary report on the physical and psychological health consequences of women and adolescents trafficked in Europe. *London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine*, 23-50. Retrieved from https://www.cabdirect.org/cabdirect/abstract/20063133320

The report summarizes the physical and psychological implications of trafficking among women and adolescents in Europe. The article details the damage that trafficking inflicts on women's health and wellbeing and the need to develop services to support victim recovery. The article examines whether current posttrafficking services are meeting the needs of victims. It describes the assistance needed by survivors to reintegrate into society, such as financial support, medical care access and shelter. Statistical data was collected from trafficked women and girls to identify the health outcomes of this vulnerable population in Europe. Findings reveal that many women exposed to exploitative and violent situations experienced physical, sexual, and psychological health implications. Health care providers are faced with challenges such as limited staff and insufficient financial resources to provide on-going quality support to trafficked victims. Although information in this report can be used to provide more holistic care to trafficked women, more information is needed on how organizations and providers can combat service limitations to better meet the needs of trafficked populations. Nonetheless, this report provides a full set of data on trafficked victims in Europe and illustrates the range of health consequences suffered by victims from exploitative situations. This information can be used to inform future policies and program implementation, which will contribute to the recovery of victims and rebuild their well-being.

3. Psychological/Health Needs

Abas, M., Ostrovschi, N., Prince, M., Gorceag, V., Trigub, C., Oram. S. (2013). Risk factors for mental health disorders in women survivors of human trafficking: A historical cohort study. *BMC Psychiatry*, *13*(204).

This cohort study describes risk factors for symptoms of anxiety, depression and post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) among female victims of human trafficking. Trafficked women aged 18 and over (n = 176), who were under the assistance of the International Organization of Migration (IOM), were recruited for the study. Participants were interviewed by psychiatrists and assessed to determine if they met DSM-4 diagnostic criteria for the above-mentioned mental conditions. Findings revealed that over half of the women (54%) met criteria for DSM-4 mental disorder: 36% had PTSD, 12% had depression, and 6% had an anxiety disorder. Major risk factors that increased the development of mental health symptoms were childhood emotional, physical and sexual abuse. Social support played a role in facilitating recovery and reducing mental health symptoms. A major strength of this study is the use of standardized questionnaires and clinical interviews conducted by professional psychiatrists, who were blind to the purpose of the study, to reduce recall and observer bias. The study was unable to fully test the validity of each instrument used, as it was conducted over an 18-month period, and the sample size was limited to women in human trafficking who had returned from Moldova and were under the IOM. This study demonstrates that mental health assessments should be incorporated in the re-integration post-care for female victims of human trafficking. It also indicates that the development of symptoms is influenced by past traumatic experiences such as childhood sexual abuse, which is compounded by the abuse of human trafficking.

Clawson, H., Salomon, A., Goldblatt, G. (2008). Treating the hidden wounds: Trauma treatment and mental health recovery for victims of human trafficking. *Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.*

This issue reviews relevant literature related to human trafficking and identifies barriers in practices addressing the needs of victims of human trafficking. The article explores the physical, emotional and mental impact of trauma experienced by trafficked survivors and its effect on their well-being. The study reviews the challenges in meeting the specific needs of this marginalized population and discusses approaches for treatment and recovery. These included: Education and training of staff, screening for trauma in multiple settings and review of organization policies to promote trauma-informed care. Although the article focuses specifically on sex trafficking of young women and girls, it identifies current challenges in human trafficking services, such as building basic supports, safety, treatment alternatives for foreign-born victims and cooperation between multiple systems of care that may impede access to services. This issue can be used to inform current and future programs designed to combat human trafficking and to offer insight into improving services to better meet the needs of trafficked victims.

Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women. (2015). Unmet needs: emotional support and care after trafficking. *Briefing Paper*. Retrieved from http://www.lefoe.at/tl_files/lefoe/GAATW_Briefing Paper_Unmet_Needs.10.2015.pdf

This article discusses unmet emotional needs and after-care supports for victims of human trafficking. This article sought the feedback and opinions of trafficked persons to gain their input on service gaps and efficacy. The project was initiated by members of the Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) from Latin America, Asia and Europe. Members interviewed 121 victims, including men, women and children, who experienced trafficking and accessed recovery services. Findings revealed six main barriers to post-trafficking care: Lack of informal emotional and moral support from organizations, poor ongoing support, lack of services for trafficked men, public stigma, little family and community involvements and scarce peer support groups. The article offers recommendations from GAATW members to aid service providers (e.g. peer group support meetings, family psychoeducational classes, etc.). Little information is provided, however, on the effectiveness of suggestions, and if they have been previously tested or proven to work. A major strength of this study is that interviews were conducted with victims who varied in age, gender and nationality. This provided a diverse array of feedback to inform current service efficacy. Overall, this study aims to improve

support programs by addressing and responding to the needs of victims. Information from this document can be used to inform future program implementation and facilitate a victim-centered approach in post-trafficking aftercare.

Goldenberg, S. (2015). Supporting the mental health of trafficked people. *Lancet Psychiatry*, 2(23), 1048-1049.

This paper focuses on the need to support trafficked persons' mental health issues, relating to their having experienced violence, trauma and human rights violations. The article discusses the prevalence of mental health issues among trafficked people, such as depression and PTSD, and the effectiveness of secondary mental health programs. Data was collected using patient records from mental health organizations. The article highlights the challenges and barriers in identifying trafficked victims in clinical settings and the need to train front-line workers in health care to accurately identify victims in need. The article well describes the limitations in services for migrated victims with diverse cultural backgrounds. Little information is provided, however, on how health care settings can combat this issue and increase cultural competency. Further information is needed on how programs can better meet the needs of trafficked victims. Nonetheless, this paper provides a general overview of the lack of support received by trafficked people from mental health services and the need for improved services to meet the needs of this vulnerable population.

Hemmings, S., Jakobowitz, S., Abas, M., Bick, D., Howard, L. M., Stanley, N., ... & Oram, S. (2016). Responding to the health needs of survivors of human trafficking: a systematic review. *BMC Health Services Research*, *16*(1), 320.

This study reviews current literature on service provision to survivors of human trafficking and discusses whether services are meeting the needs of survivors. Data was collected from electronic databases, reference lists from selected articles, and consultations with experts in the field of human trafficking. Data was further extracted using framework analysis. A total of 44 research papers were included in the systematic review. Findings revealed that articles on victim identification are limited and more information is needed on accurately recognizing victims in health care settings. Results indicated that in order to improve service provision, programs need to implement trauma-informed policies, develop cultural sensitivity among staff, and assess the needs of victims to promote recovery and healing. Although little information is provided on how organizations can work together to improve provision of care, this review provides guidance on human trafficking service improvements to better support and meet the needs of victims.

4. Housing Needs

Baker, D. A., & Grover, E. A. (2013). Responding to victims of human trafficking: Interagency awareness, housing services, and spiritual care. *Social Work & Christianity*, 40(3), 308-321.

This paper examines inter-agency awareness, rehabilitation services and the providing of spiritual care in 50 human trafficking services for victims in five Southern California counties. The article evaluates the quality and variety of services provided, how trafficking agencies respond to victims, and interagency awareness for client referrals. Several findings were identified. First, inter-agency awareness was primarily developed by attending community meetings or from word of mouth. Second, the most sought-after rehabilitation service for trafficked victims is housing to meet domestic needs. Third, spiritual care is the least offered service available for survivors in these counties. This study serves to strengthen inter-agency awareness in California and highlights ways services can improve to provide quality care. Some participants failed to fully complete the online questionnaire, so data that could potentially inform the study was lost. As well, the data interpreted from each agency was one-dimensional, and no cross-tabulations were performed to provide two-dimensional data. Despite these weaknesses, this study identifies the need to improve access to spiritual care

and housing for victims, in order to support reintegration into civilian society. This paper suggests that interagency awareness can help improve collaboration between services, as well as enhance program quality.

Clawson, H., Dutch, N. (2008). Addressing the needs of victims of human trafficking: Challenges, barriers, and promising practices. *Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.*

This issue focuses on whether the needs of trafficked victims are being met by services provided, and identifies barriers to services for international adult victims, international minor victims and domestic minor victims. The issue discusses common needs among each vulnerable group, such as safety, and elaborates on the distinction between needs of international and domestic victims. For example, an immediate need for domestic victims is food, clothing and housing. Whereas an immediate need for international victims is translation services to facilitate communication of needs and to prevent feelings of neglect. The needs between adults and minor victims differed as well. The article highlights that adults are in greater need of transportation, long-term housing and financial assistance, when compared to the needs of minor victims. Domestic minor victims are in greater need of substance abuse treatment than international adults and minors, due to the prevalence of western drug culture. Regarding available services, the article indicates that programs, such as The Unaccompanied Refugee Minor (URM) program, are needed for international minor victims to help them obtain T-visas and other documentation to stay in Canada and gain access to much needed services (e.g. mental health counselling, education, etc.). Challenges identified in meeting the needs of victims included: Availability of services, appropriateness of services for international victims, lack of knowledge of human trafficking among service providers, access to services, language barriers and length of services. Some recommendations provided to combat challenges in service provision included: Transportation services to increase accessibility, collaboration between cultural centers, legal services and human trafficking programs to aid international victims, and volunteer programs for victims to utilize during their waiting period. More information is needed on how to provide effective emergency, short-term and long-term aid to victims of human trafficking. Nonetheless, the issue outlines ways in which programs can improve services and reduce barriers to ensure that human trafficking services meet the needs of both international and domestic victims.

Gibbs, D., Walters, J., Lutnick, A., Miller, S., & Kluckman, M. (2015). Services to domestic minor victims of sex trafficking: Opportunities for engagement and support. *Children and Youth Services Review*, *54*(7), 1-7.

This paper evaluates three human trafficking programs for young domestic survivors in the U.S. Selected programs offered case management services and collaborated with other organizations to meet the needs of victims. Interviews were conducted with domestic minor victims of sex trafficking, and participants were asked about service needs and program delivery. Findings revealed that domestic minor victims were in need of housing, educational, employment and mental health services. Victims revealed that they felt emotionally vulnerable with traffickers, as they were required to exchange sex in order to acquire life-essentials, and they identified barriers to service delivery. Barriers involved: Continuity of care, lack of long-term support, inability to meet culturally diverse victims' needs, and resource barriers. A strength of this study is the diversity of feedback from domestic minor victims, including minors from child welfare programs, juvenile systems, and runaways, which provided insight on service effectiveness. However, findings cannot be generalized to the larger population of trafficked minors due to the small sample size. Despite this weakness, the article highlights the urgent needs of trafficked minors who have not been fully recognized in previous literature.

Lazarus, L., Chettiar, J., Deering, K., Nabess, R., & Shannon, K. (2011). Risky health environments: Women sex workers' struggles to find safe, secure and non-exploitative housing in Canada's poorest postal code. *Social Science & Medicine*, *73*(11), 1600-1607.

This study evaluates the housing environments of female sex workers in poor areas of Vancouver, B.C., Canada. The article examines the experiences of women in transitional housing and the financial challenges faced by shelters. Participants were recruited from several housing environments, which included transitional homes, single room occupancy hotels, and homeless shelters. A total of 73 women involved in sex work took part in focus group discussions and shared their experiences in support systems. Findings revealed that current housing environments are in poor condition and are infested with bed bugs or rats. Many women found the housing policies restrictive and felt it difficult to comply with set curfews and guest rules. This resulted in riskier behavior, such as leaving the home to perform sex work outdoors and accepting risky clients to meet the set curfew. Participants preferred flexible hours and wished to bring clients home to reduce infringement on their individual freedom. Narratives also revealed that women in male-dominated shelters experienced greater violence and exploitation and were more likely to engage in intimate relationships with male residents. The study showed that the greatest needs for homeless women in the sex trade are independence and safety from further exploitation. Women would prefer to negotiate their health and safety to make transitional homes more habitable and suitable for living. Several limitations were identified in this study. First, the purposive sample of women in transitional homes cannot be generalized to all women in lowincome housing who are involved in sex work. Second, the study only employed qualitative methodology. Quantitative measures should have been incorporated to gain further understanding of housing policies and rehabilitation programs for women in sex work. Nonetheless, this study acknowledges the experiences and challenges women face in transitional homes, due to low-income, poor sleeping conditions and housing policies. Information from this paper can be used to inform future housing programs and women shelters for sex workers in Canada.

PART III: GAPS IN HUMAN TRAFFICKING SERVICES

A. Overview

This section of the annotated bibliography describes current gaps in service provision for trafficked victims and offers recommendations on addressing challenges to improve future programs and provision of care. It focuses on gaps in human trafficking, including training for providers and inaccurate victim identification.

B. Annotated Bibliography

1. Services for Human Trafficking: Issues and Challenges

Andreas, P., & Greenhill, K. M. (Eds.). (2010). *Sex, drugs, and body counts: The politics of numbers in global crime and conflict*. New York, NY: Cornell University Press.

In Sex, Drugs, and Body Counts, policy analysts, political scientists, sociologists and anthropologists critically examine the use of statistics in reporting human trafficking and drug trade in media communications and political debates. Ten scholarly articles were selected and analyzed to determine how quantitative data was derived and interpreted in each paper. Findings revealed that most data used to inform U.S. policy decisions were partially or completely fabricated. Editors, Peter Andreas and Kelly M. Greenhill, concluded that numbers are most likely false and suggest that statistical claims are questionable and difficult to verify. The book provides statistically reliable examples of how researchers can accurately record and interpret numbers to prevent false statements from being released and accepted by the media or policymakers. The book is good introductory material for quantitative literature and for promoting discussion on how to ensure reliability in statistics reporting.

Aron, L., Zweig, J. M., & Newmark, L. C., (2006). *Comprehensive services for survivors of human trafficking: Findings from clients from three communities: Final report.* Washington, D.C: Justice Policy Center.

This report describes programs for survivors of human trafficking, and the issues faced in providing effective services to this exploited population. The report examines the needs of trafficked persons and offers

recommendations on how programs can improve to increase service efficacy. One-on-one interviews were conducted with survivors receiving comprehensive services in three US cities. A total of 34 clients from trafficking recovery programs participated in the study (13 clients in Site A, 14 in Site B and 7 in Site C). Findings revealed that there is a mismatch between service planning and survivor needs. For example, some services are not culturally-sensitive, which can be isolating for international trafficked persons. A major strength of this study is that all clients interviewed were trafficked internationally. This provided insight on the experience of victims from Korea, Vietnam, Latin America and African nations. Findings for international clients may have been distorted and lost through translation during interviews with interpreters. Nonetheless, this article reflects specific needs and issues of trafficked persons, and current challenges in implementing services, such as limited resources and service availability. The document sheds light on how services can be improved to better meet the needs of survivors and promote recovery.

Ahn, R., Alpert, E. J., Purcell, G., Konstantopoulos, W. M., McGahan, A., Cafferty, E., ... & Burke, T. F. (2013). Human trafficking: review of educational resources for health professionals. *American journal of preventive medicine*, *44*(3), 283-289.

This review provides healthcare workplace recommendations to promote trauma-informed care treatment for trafficked persons in therapeutic settings. The article offers educational guidelines that may be applied in the workplace to ensure that healthcare providers are well-equipped to serve individuals in a compassionate, sensitive and culturally responsive manner. A total of 27 papers were selected and reviewed to identify current guidelines in the curriculum for professionals treating human trafficked survivors. Findings revealed convergence and divergence of responses on how to appropriately treat survivors and train healthcare providers. Each article varied on resources provided, referral processes, victim assessment and identification, as well as treatment recommendations. This paper suggests that comprehensive educational training is needed for health care professionals that focuses on human trafficking and educates on appropriately helping survivors. Several limitations were identified in this study. First, articles lacked information on how to help survivors of human trafficking at individual, interpersonal and societal levels. Second, the reviews selected for this article offered little to no instruction on the role professionals play in the prevention of human trafficking, as opposed to simply the interprofessional response. Third, no articles discussed the impact and efficacy of human trafficking training on healthcare professionals and its outcome on their work in treating trafficked victims. Even though none of the resources addressed behavioural change outcomes, this review sheds light on the important role providers and healthcare settings play in the identification, intervention and prevention of human trafficking.

McGough, M. Q. (2013). Ending modern-day slavery: Using research to inform U.S. anti-human trafficking efforts. *National Institute of Justice Journal*, *271*, 26-32.

This study examines the legal challenges in the criminal justice system in combatting trafficking in the U.S. The article covers the social and political issues of human trafficking and the initiatives developed to combat the problem by increasing public awareness and victim identification training. The article critiques the response of the criminal justice system and the lack of research on anti-trafficking efforts, due to financial constraints and limited resources. A multi-site study was conducted with 166 practitioners from local, state and federal law enforcement. Interviews were conducted, and participants were asked to share and discuss the challenges faced in the legal system with trafficking cases. Three challenges in law enforcement were identified: Victim identification challenges due to perpetrator efforts to hide or move victims, investigation challenges due to threats victims receive from traffickers, should they disclose events, and prosecution challenges due to little or no prosecutorial guidance for trials. Although the sample is not representative of the general population of prosecutors, findings provide insight on legal obstacles faced by government officials in improving legislation and trial procedures surrounding human trafficking. Nonetheless, this paper sheds light on challenges in the

criminal justice system in developing counter-trafficking legislation and law enforcement processes to protect victims and prosecute traffickers.

Powell, C., Asbill, M., Louis, E., & Stoklosa, H. (2018). Identifying gaps in human trafficking mental health service provision. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, *4*(3), 256-269.

The study investigates gaps and challenges in current mental health services for victims of human trafficking in the United States. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 15 different post-trafficking mental health programs. Interviews were transcribed and analyzed using deductive framework analysis to produce several underlying themes. Several challenges were identified in the study: Failure to meet victims' mental health needs, limited resources and staff, poor multisector responses, and lack of collaboration among allied services. The article offers suggestions on improving service provision, including increased collaboration among allied sectors, training of staff on how to provide trauma-informed care to better meet client needs, and expanding health professionals' capabilities. More information is needed on creating a better client-centered approach and on providing trauma-informed care at an organizational and management level to improve service provision. As well, limited recommendations are provided on how organizations can address the cultural barriers for foreign born nationals who have been internationally trafficked. Nonetheless, the article describes the challenges faced by mental health organizations in providing effective treatment services to trafficked victims.

Twigg, N. M., (2017). Comprehensive care model for sex trafficking survivors. *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, *49*(3), 259-266.

The current study reviews post-trafficking services for domestic minors who have been sexually exploited by human trafficking. Data was collected from interviews with domestic minors and health care staff from five different treatment programs in the U.S. Interviews were transcribed and analyzed. Findings revealed that services are not effectively meeting the needs of domestic minors. Greater effort is needed to support substance abuse issues among youth, access to education, and facilitating family reunification. Information from this study can be used to improve human trafficking programs for domestic minors and to promote patient-centered care in existing social services. Limited information is provided on how health care providers, including nurses and social workers, may gain greater understanding of human trafficking and become more capable in helping victims. The article sheds light on the challenges and barriers encountered by victims of trafficking in accessing services and the need for program improvement to better serve victims of commercial sex work.

Williamson, E., Dutch, N., & Clawson, H. C. (2008). Evidence-based mental health treatment for the victims of human trafficking. *Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation*, U.S. Department of *Health and Human Services*.

The document evaluates the efficacy of mental health treatment programs that are evidence-based for victims of human trafficking. It examines the prevalence of trauma among this vulnerable population and the need to address the mental health concerns of victims by providing trauma-informed care. The document examines the effectiveness of current therapeutic modalities in treating victims' mental health conditions and how implementing interventions can be improved. The article discusses whether programs are meeting victims' mental health needs, and if research efforts are successful in identifying effective therapeutic methods. Findings revealed that victims experience a variety of health conditions including PTSD, substance abuse disorders, anxiety disorders, trauma and depression. Limited information is provided on effective treatment models for specific populations and on the challenges faced by providers in giving trauma-informed care. Nonetheless, the article provides information on evidence-based treatments associated with human trafficking and the health implications experienced by victims from traumatic events. Information from this

article can be used to determine the most effective evidence-based treatment, that will provide optimal care for victims. Long-term population specific studies are needed to provide conclusive evidence of the efficacy of treatment modalities and their effectiveness in supporting the recovery of survivors.

Williamson, E., Dutch, N., & Clawson, H. C. (2008). National symposium on the health needs of human trafficking victims: Post-symposium brief. *Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services*.

The document discusses findings from a national symposium which focused on how post-trafficking services may be improved to meet the needs of victims. Feedback was collected from 150 professionals and program directors who attended the symposium and whose work is impacted by human trafficking. The symposium covered five topics on human trafficking trends, victim identification, health service provision, and future recommendations. The article discusses the role of mental health professionals in working with victims of trafficking and the need to provide training programs on trafficking, in order to increase provider confidence and improve provision of care. The document identifies specific populations that are vulnerable to exploitation, such as people with disabilities. It addresses the need to educate the public on trafficking trends to increase awareness and prevent further exploitation. The article discusses gaps in human trafficking research, due to the hidden and secretive nature of the phenomenon. More information is needed on which practices are best for treating victims of human trafficking and identifying protective factors for vulnerable groups. Despite these limitations, the symposium encouraged greater collaboration among different service providers to combat trafficking. Findings from this article can be used to inform policymakers and post-trafficking services to better meet the service needs of survivors.

2. Challenges in Victim Identification for Human Trafficking

Baldwin, S., Eisenman, D., Sayles, J., Ryan, G., & Chuang, K. (2011). Identification of human trafficking victims in health care settings. *Health and Human Rights*, *13*(1), 36-49.

This qualitative study examines the identification of human trafficking victims in U.S. health care settings. The article describes victim traits, so health care professionals can identify victims who receive medical care, while under traffickers' control. Participants were recruited from the non-governmental organization, Coalition to Abolish Slavery and Trafficking, and 12 female survivors were selected, along with 6 trafficking informants. Semi-structured interviews were conducted and interpreted, using framework analysis to identify underlying themes. Findings revealed that majority of trafficked victims visited medical settings for treatment but were unable to disclose their oppression, due to language barriers, fear, or limited interaction with professionals. Sex trafficking victims had medical visits to test for sexually transmitted diseases or abortion, whereas labour trafficking victims had medical visits for physical injury or respiratory illness. The study explored challenges in victim identification and screening in medical settings and offered screening suggestions to facilitate disclosure (e.g. "Do you live in a safe home?"). Due to the small sample size, findings cannot be generalized across all trafficked persons in the U.S., and experiences differ between survivors who escaped and found support services and those who did not. Nonetheless, this paper emphasizes the important role health professionals play in the identification and prevention of human trafficking in medical centers and provides recommendations on what providers can do to prevent further trafficking. The paper suggests that more training and education should be employed among professionals to improve victim identification and increase awareness of human trafficking in the workplace.

Mumma, B. E., Scofield, M. E., Mendoza, L. P., Toofan, Y., Youngyunpipatkul, J., & Hernandez, B. (2017). Screening for victims of sex trafficking in the emergency department: a pilot program. *Western journal of emergency medicine*, *18*(4), 616.

This study evaluates the effectiveness of screening tools used to identify trafficked victims in the emergency department. The paper also examines the sensitivity of physicians in administering instruments and conducting interviews. A total of 143 female patients aged 18-40, who were previously trafficked, were recruited for the study and asked to complete a questionnaire. Findings revealed that the screening tools were better at identifying sex trafficked victims than physician concerns. This suggests that a screening survey is more sensitive than physician concerns in identifying victims of sex trafficking, as well a single screening question may be appropriate in an emergency department setting. Findings cannot be generalized to other settings, as the sample was solely drawn from patients in the emergency department. As well, victim identification was based on patient records or self-identification. The numbers of trafficked victims may be skewed, due to the secret and hidden nature of trafficking. Despite these weaknesses, the study reveals that brief screening tools can be used to effectively and sensitively identify trafficked victims, as opposed to relying on physician concerns.

Reid, J. (2010). Doors wide shut: Barriers to the successful delivery of victim services for domestically trafficked minors in a southern U.S. metropolitan area. *Women & Criminal Justice, 20*(2), 147-166.

The paper discusses sex trafficking of domestic minors and the efficacy of recovery services in helping survivors. The article assesses methods used to accurately identify victims and the challenges faced by domestic minors in accessing programs. The paper also examines legal protocols for sex trafficking cases with minors and whether current policies are effective in protecting victims. A rapid assessment methodology was employed in which data was collected from 34 interviews with trafficking service staff and existing research. Findings revealed that due to the hidden nature of sexual exploitation, it is difficult to find trafficked minors. Other challenges identified included: Denial of victimization, refusal to cooperate with legal staff, and difficulty in freeing victims from violence. Health professionals are unaware of the likelihood that they will encounter trafficked victims, so they do not attempt to identify them in clinical settings. As well, current legal procedures are insufficient in ensuring the protection of victims and prosecution of traffickers. The paper reveals a lack of appropriate programs for victims and training of staff in relation to sex trafficking of minors. A targeted timeframe to complete the study reduced the inclusion of additional service staff to participate and share their work experiences with trafficked minors. Nonetheless, the study demonstrates the multitude of barriers, that impede access to mental health services for sexually exploited youth. Greater effort is needed to help victims therapeutically and legally.

3. The Role of Professionals in Relation to Human Trafficking

CdeBaca, L., & Sigmon, J. N. (2014). Combating trafficking in persons: a call to action for global health professionals. *Global Health, Science and Practice*, *2*(3), 261–267.

This document emphasizes the role of mental health care professionals in combatting human trafficking. The article focuses on the role of health professionals in victim identification, implementing effective treatment interventions and training other professionals in order to promote recovery of trafficked persons and to improve treatment program delivery. The article highlights the need for health care organizations to develop new protocols and safe procedures to sensitively address the needs of trafficked persons and to provide quality care to victims post-trafficking. The article urges health professionals to undergo specialized education and training to learn better interview techniques and to use appropriate screening instruments. The article provides suggestions for organizations and health settings to employ to better equip professionals in serving this vulnerable population. Recommendations included: Developing trauma-informed policies, partnering with non-government or faith-based organizations to address additional victim needs, increasing awareness of local and government laws surrounding human trafficking, and taking human trafficking courses to better identify and respond to trafficked persons. The document lists additional resources that organizations can use to increase human trafficking knowledge. However, little information is provided on the effectiveness of each

recommendation, on treatment intervention, and on screening tools that practitioners may incorporate in their practice. Nonetheless, this document provides guidelines on how organizations can become more trauma-informed and better equipped to address the vulnerable population of human trafficked persons.

Department of Justice Canada. (2015). A Handbook for Criminal Justice Practitioners on Trafficking in Persons. *Federal/Provincial/Territorial Working Group on Trafficking in Persons*. Retrieved from http://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/rp-pr/cj-jp/tp/hcjpotp-gtpupjp/hcjpotp-gtpupjp.pdf

This report was designed to inform criminal-justice practitioners with detailed information on how to investigate and prosecute human trafficking cases. The document was developed to ensure that practitioners in the criminal justice system fully respect the needs and rights of survivors of human trafficking. It is meant to encourage collaboration among federal, provincial and territorial ministers in addressing trafficking cases. The handbook is divided into six chapters which provide: (1) an overview of human trafficking in the literature, (2) history of specific human trafficking cases, (3) guidance on victim recovery and interviewing, (4) how Crown Prosecutors should proceed during trials, (5) sentencing considerations, and (6) trafficking services available in Canada. Although little information is provided on the effectiveness of these suggestions at a provincial or federal level, this report may be a valuable resource to promote trauma-informed care in the judicial system. It can be used to implement a criminal justice response that is receptive to victims' needs and that respects their rights.

Domoney, J., Hoard, L. M., Abas, M., Broadbent, M., & Oram, S. (2015). Mental health service responses to human trafficking: A qualitative study of professionals' experiences of providing care. *BMC Psychiatry*, *15*, 289-297.

This qualitative study explores the experiences of mental health professionals working with trafficked populations and identifies the challenges faced by providers in service provision and victim identification. Data was collected from electronic patient records and analyzed, using both content and thematic analysis from 130 trafficked patients. Findings revealed that health providers struggle with unstable situations of patients, such as immigration status, accommodation, and legal standing with court proceedings. These issues create barriers to continuity of care and interrupt the provider-patient relationship. Other themes that were derived included: Lack of patient engagement, poor collaboration among inter-agency services, and determining patient histories from disclosures. This study explored how victims are identified in mental health services and how providers respond to patients' needs. Although providers may have varied in the type and detail information recorded, the article used a unique approach to collect data by reviewing electronic patient records. Overall, this paper highlights the challenges experienced by both patients and providers in mental health services, such as the constant instability of patients' circumstances. Information from this article can be used to inform future research and treatment programs.

Dovydaitis T. (2010). Human Trafficking: Role of the health provider. *Journal of Midwifery Women Health, 55*, 462-467.

This article focuses on the role providers play in the identification, treatment and assessment of victims of human trafficking. The article provides information on potential screening tools, interview techniques, and diagnostic instruments that practitioners may apply in their practice to improve clinical outcomes and service provision. The article discusses ways in which providers can identify victims in health care settings and the steps that clinicians can make to establish a plan of care for survivors. The article states that treatment plans need to be client specific and should meet immediate, short-term and long-term needs. The article lists procedures for providers to follow to give survivors a sense of safety. It also provides legal protocols to follow to ensure client protection. The document outlines a real case-study that providers can refer to and offers resources for providers to learn more. The article does not elaborate on steps to take when encountering a

victim with a cultural or language barrier. However, it does offer specific tools and information that providers can refer to, to help all victims of human trafficking, both men and women, adults and children.

Powell, C., Dickins, K., & Stoklosa, H. (2017). Training U.S. health care professionals on human trafficking: where do we go from here?. *Medical Education Online*, *22*(1).

The mixed method study assesses the training of health professionals in the United States on human trafficking and victim identification. The study reviews the curriculum provided to professionals and discusses whether the training, if offered, was effective in equipping providers with the necessary skills and knowledge to aid victims. Data was collected from structured interviews with trainers of human trafficking programs and health care providers' calls to the National Human Trafficking Resource Center. Findings revealed that human trafficking training does not provide sufficient knowledge and skills to deal with trafficked victims. Data showed that calls to the resource center have increased since 2008, and providers revealed that human trafficking information is inconsistent. The article highlights the need for standardized content, so information is consistent among providers, as well as the incorporation of metrics to measure patient outcomes, such as behaviour change. Due to the use of snowball recruitment, findings cannot be generalized. Despite this weakness, the article illustrates how provider training programs can be improved. It offers recommendations to equip professionals with the necessary skills and knowledge to help trafficked victims in clinical settings.

Viergever, R. F., West, H., Borland, R., & Zimmerman, C. (2015). Health care providers and human trafficking: what do they know, what do they need to know? Findings from the Middle East, the Caribbean, and Central America. *Frontiers in public health*, *3*, 6.

The study investigates the current human trafficking curriculum for health care providers and whether information provided is effective in equipping practitioners with the necessary skills to identify and treat victims. The pilot study tested human trafficking training among health providers in the Middle East, the Caribbean and Central America. A total of 178 providers took part in the study. Participants were required to attend two-day training sessions and complete both pre-training and post-training questionnaires. Findings revealed that pre-training human trafficking knowledge was appropriate. Providers were aware of the increased prevalence of trafficking in persons and the health implications on victims. However, victim identification and knowledge of the provider's role in assisting victims were limited. Post-training feedback questionnaires revealed increased knowledge of the provider's role in response to trafficking cases and awareness of victim characteristics of trafficked persons. Although the training program was a pilot test and its efficacy cannot be fully determined, the article demonstrates that training providers on human trafficking. The study demonstrates that further education is needed among providers to ensure practitioners possess the skills and knowledge to identify, refer and care for trafficked persons in clinical settings.

4. Future Recommendations to Combat Human Trafficking

Centre for research and evaluation on violence against women. (2011). Evaluating Violence Against Women Training Initiatives: A Primer. Retrieved from <u>http://www.learningtoendabuse.ca/site</u> <u>2012s/default/files/Evaluation_VAW_Training_October_1_2012.pdf</u>

This report provides an overview of the Violence Against Women (VAW) training developed by the Learning Network to support and promote education against gender-based violence in Canada. The document was designed to inform training and to serve professionals, the general public, and the government. The VAW training program outlines the importance of tailoring curriculum to a specific target audience, being mindful of cultural and language barriers, using effective communication strategies in training to increase credibility, and how to rigorously evaluate project outcomes to maximize training impact and initiatives. Four types of

evaluations were conducted: Preliminary evaluation, formal evaluation, outcome evaluation and economic evaluation to develop a clear understanding of training objectives and program goals. Data was collected and examined from VAW resources including curricula, research reports and evaluation tools. Findings revealed the training program was effective in: Increasing awareness, changing attitudes and behaviours, organizational processes, and reducing violence. The training program was based on evidence-based practices and logical models of formal evaluation. Due to the variation in methodology, scope and scientific rigor of past training programs, findings revealed that it was difficult to specify best practices, despite the consensus of its effectiveness. Thus, findings cannot be easily generalized to other populations. Nonetheless, the VAW training protocols promoted and supported the specialized training of professionals in gender-based violence. The document encourages scholars and organizations to undergo systematic reviews at various levels by analyzing training effects through the following: Reactions, learning, behaviour changes and problem solving to increase program impact and training success.

Department of State United States of America. (2016). Trafficking in persons report. Retrieved from <u>https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/258876.pdf</u>

The report details a yearlong effort developed by the Department of State to address the problem of human trafficking in the United States. The document incorporates current efforts made by NGOs, advocates and survivors to combat sex trafficking. The article emphasizes the need for increased collaboration with local and provincial organizations, as well as international partners, to increase prevention efforts and victim identification. The report focuses on strategies developed by organizations, faith groups and governments to better address the needs of victims and prevent human trafficking of young women and men. The article discusses financial support from the government to develop programs to combat trafficking and how funds will be allocated to further research and trafficking training programs for workers. A major strength of this report is the incorporation of victim stories and experiences to inform the literature review and improve strategies to combat human trafficking. As well, the article discusses risk factors associated with being trafficked such as: Sexual orientation, religious affiliation, ethnicity, or having disabilities. Little information is provided on legislation to protect this vulnerable population at both national and international levels. Nonetheless, the document evaluates the status of sex trafficking and child sex trafficking in the United States and offers insight into how organizations and government officials plan to combat this issue over the next couple of years to prevent further exploitation

Department of Justice Canada (2016). From the ground up: Working with survivors for Survivors. *Human Trafficking Survivors Led Initiative Summary Report*. Retrieved from <u>http://www.fcjrefugeecentre.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/Human-Trafficking-Survivors-Led-Iniciative.pdf</u>

This report summarizes the findings of a discussion with human trafficking victims in Canada to determine whether services are meeting the needs of survivors and what programs can do to improve. The program was developed by FCJ Refugee Centre and East Metro Youth Services in partnership with the Department of Justice in Canada to improve solutions in combatting human trafficking. Two focus groups were facilitated. Five participants took part in the group of domestic survivors of human trafficking, and seven participants took part in the group of international survivors of human trafficking. Findings were shared during a round table discussion with service providers from the Toronto Human Trafficking Network and Human Trafficking survivors are not meeting the needs of victims. Participants revealed that long waitlists and constant referrals created feelings of "un-belongingness". Mental health professionals showed insensitivity to people's experiences by asking invasive questions. There was no proper model for aftercare for those who needed ongoing support. A major strength of this qualitative study was the opportunity for survivors to voice their opinions to inform future program implementation. However, a limitation in this study is that findings cannot be generalized to different populations and settings, since the study took place primarily in Toronto, Ontario,

Canada. As well, there is no indication of how many men or women took part in the focus groups to disclose differences in service provision regarding post-trafficking support. Nonetheless, this qualitative report can be used to inform future practices, and the inclusion of human trafficking survivors' opinions may lead to more appropriate support. The report offers suggestions on how services can be improved, such as creating a human trafficking helpline so those in immediate need of services can gain access to programs, and training health professionals to increase sensitivity and human trafficking knowledge.

Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services. (2016). Ontario strategy to end human trafficking.

Let's Human Trafficking in Ontario. Retrieved from <u>https://www.mcss.gov.on.ca/en/mcss/programs/humantrafficking/index.aspx</u>

The document presents current trends of human trafficking in Ontario and recognizable signs of trafficked victims, to raise awareness among the general public and help prevent further exploitation. The article reveals misconceptions regarding trafficking, such as the idea that all sex workers are victims. The article describes those who are susceptible to victimization, based on risk factors identified from survivors. The author clarifies false assumptions and explains the distinction between prostitution which is sex work by choice, and human trafficking, in which individuals are exploited by another person and forced to participate. The document also explores the topic of labour trafficking in Ontario and mentions steps people can take to direct victims to appropriate services and resources within Ontario. Information in this article is restricted to residents within the Province of Ontario, so findings cannot be generalized to different populations in different settings. Nonetheless, this informative piece provides general information on human trafficking that can be used to educate the public and raise further awareness of trafficking in the Province.

Okech, D., Morreau, W., & Benson, K. (2012). Human trafficking: Improving victim identification and service provision. *International Social Work*, *55*(4), 488-503.

This article assesses anti-trafficking legislation, the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) in the U.S., and the effort of government officials in protecting victims and prosecuting traffickers for forced exploitation. The article details the origins and trends of human trafficking within various countries and discusses global prevention efforts to combat the growing issue. Authors discuss specific post-trafficking interventions to promote the recovery and well-being of survivors and offer recommendations on how to increase victim identification in public settings. Although prevention efforts are limited due to inaccurate victim identification and inappropriate post-trafficking services, the article presents potential solutions and recommendations that can be implemented to better serve victims and increase prevention efforts. The paper demonstrates how the TVPA has helped to protect victims and reduce exploitation. However, findings reveal that more research and financial investment are needed to strengthen victim identification and bridge the gaps in post-trafficking services.

Peel Regional Police. (2016). 2016 Annual Report. *A Safer Community Together*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.peelpolice.ca/en/who-we-are/resources/Documents/annual-reports/2016AnnualReport-</u> <u>Final.pdf</u>

The annual report highlights the accomplishments of Peel Regional Police during 2016 in their efforts to maintain the safety and well being of Canadians following the 2014-15 strategic plan. Data was collected from community members and staff to gain information on the effectiveness of policing services over the past year to inform future programming. Findings revealed a need for more collaboration and transparency between policing services and the community. Initiatives created to address this concern included: Opening committee meetings to Peel residents, posting public reports on public websites and broadcasting agendas on TV, such as Rogers Cable Television. Information is limited on the effectiveness of these strategies in improving police

and community relations. Nonetheless, the annual report demonstrates the commitment of Peel Regional Police to the community and their desire to improve services to meet civilians' needs.

Polaris. (2015). Promising practices: An overview of trauma-informed therapeutic support for survivors of human trafficking. *Polaris Project*. Retrieved from <u>https://polarisproject.org/sites/default/files/Sanar-Promising-Practices.pdf</u>

The document provides detailed information on the efforts of Polaris, a post human trafficking service, to improve treatment interventions and support services for trafficked persons. The report details the main objectives of the organization to support victims in the processing of trauma and fostering resiliency post-trafficking. The article explains how direct client programs will be reviewed and modified to enhance the rebuilding process. Findings reveal new therapeutic modalities were implemented to support the recovery of survivors. These modalities include restorative yoga, art therapy and mindfulness practices. The article highlights the challenges in successful implementation of new treatment programs and offers recommendations on dealing with obstacles. For example, lack of attendance to weekly yoga classes can be resolved by offering pre-recorded classes for clients to do at home at their convenience. The program modification lacked evaluation protocols, such as control and intervention groups, to identify the effectiveness of new modalities. Nonetheless, the report offers potential recommendations on how allied sectors can improve resiliency and enhance recovery programs to better support trafficked victims.

Public Safety Canada. (2013). National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking. *2012-2013 Annual report on progress*. Retrieved from <u>https://www.publicsafety.gc.ca/cnt/rsrcs/pblctns/ntnl-ctn-pln-cmbt/index-en.aspx</u>

This article reviews the National Action Plan of Canada in combatting human trafficking. The progress report details the on-going efforts of the Government of Canada to oppose the growing problem of human trafficking. The report evaluates the comprehensive four-year plan using the 4-Ps approach: Partnership, prevention, prosecution and protection of victims. The report details the current gaps and challenges faced by organizations in providing effective post-trafficking services and accurately identifying trafficked victims. The document outlines the work completed between June 2012 and March 2013. The report reveals increased partnerships with anti-trafficking organizations, to raise trafficking awareness and to increase prevention efforts. As well, efforts have been made toward protecting foreign nationals and workers who are often targeted for exploitation. Although the article emphasizes the commitment of government officials to fight against trafficking, more work needs to be done on anti-trafficking legislation to ensure legal protection of both domestic and foreign nationals in Canada. Nonetheless, this annual report sheds light on current activities and projects that the federal government is implementing to address human trafficking at local, provincial and national levels.

Royal Canadian Mounted Police. (2012). RCMP national strategy to combat human trafficking. *Government of Canada.*. Retrieved from <u>http://publications.gc.ca/collections/collection_2014/grc-rcmp/PS64-104-2012-eng.pdf</u>

The document reviews the legal, political, environmental and economic impact of human trafficking on society and the efforts of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) to prevent further victimization. The report discusses current and future plans to combat trafficking and reduce its prevalence within the nation. Four objectives are described: (1) increase partnerships with social service organizations in Canada and abroad, (2) develop effective prevention strategies, (3) strengthen legislation to ensure the protection of victims, and (4) improve victim identification. Although more information is needed on how to improve access and delivery of services to trafficked victims, the article describes the commitment and on-going support of the RCMP, in partnership with National Action Plan to Combat Human Trafficking of the Government of Canada, to protect all Canadians from exploitation and violence from human trafficking.

UN Women. (2015). The Beijing declaration and platform for action turns 20. *UN Women*. Retrieved from http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/document/1776The%20Beijing%declaration%20and%20plat form520for520Action%20turns%2020.pdf

The report summarizes the 20-year appraisal of the Beijing action plan and platform, and presents findings of the assembly with government officials of United Nations Women. The report evaluates the execution of the action plan in eliminating social inequalities and promoting women's empowerment through economic and social reform. Findings reveal that more information on gender responsive initiatives is needed to promote gender equality and facilitate the well-being of women. Increased employment opportunities are available for women, which enhance women's income security. However, more efforts are needed to ensure equal pay between men and women and reduce the gap in financial standing. In addition, barriers to girls' education have been addressed, and further support is offered in the transition from school to work to improve livelihood. Despite these changes outlined in the report to address social inequalities, gender parity is still needed globally in such areas as reproductive rights, services for women in marginalized groups, and reducing violence against women by male figures. Nonetheless, the report affirms the importance of women's equal participation in society and the need to promote gender balance at local and national levels, to ensure equality and equal representation of women in various sectors and societal measures.

Weitzer, R. (2014). New directions in research on human trafficking. *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 653(1), 6-24.

The article examines current human trafficking literature and describes claims made regarding the phenomenon in relation to other global dilemmas. The article examines the international prevalence of trafficking in persons, and its current trends and implications on local, national and global levels. The article advocates for further research on trafficking in persons, particularly at a microlevel, employing both quantitative and qualitative methodology to collect accurate information on the current status of trafficking internationally. Although information from this article can be used to inform context-specific policy and law enforcement responses, more information is needed to improve victim identification to increase survivor recovery and prevent further violence. Despite this limitation, the article illustrates that micro-level empirical studies can be used as a baseline to develop official policies that are contextually appropriate and to effectively protect trafficked victims.