



FAMILY SERVICES of PEEL

Since 1971

Impact Evaluation for Anti-Human Trafficking Initiatives

- A Preliminary Literature Review

Family Services of Peel
Peel Institute on Violence Prevention
5/1/2020



Ontario

Ministry of Community
and Social Services

INTRODUCTION

Human trafficking is a vicious cycle, which continues to entrap marginalized bodies. Those who are entrapped have extreme difficulty breaking this cycle and being integrated back into society. Human trafficking is becoming de-criminalized, and every country is taking action by implanting policies to provide support for victims of trafficking. Anti-human trafficking interventions have become a part of government policies globally. Although anti-human trafficking policies have become more ingrained into societies, non-for-profits, and campaigns to end this cycle (Szablewska & Kubacki, 2018), there is no analysis of the effectiveness of these policies in the recently published literature. The purpose of this literature review is to assess impact evaluation in anti-human trafficking policies. Specifically, targeting the relationship to anti-human trafficking policies and the effectiveness in hopes of filling the gaps. Impact evaluation is the analysis of the effectiveness of policies put into place to combat human trafficking.

Additionally, many of the literature reviewed has located shortcomings in policies through the use of impact evaluation. Scholar Deanna Davy argues it is essential that impact evaluation is rigorously designed (2016). First, this literature review will examine the impact evaluation of anti-human trafficking policies. Second, this literature review will analyze how anti-human trafficking policies create a victim paradigm. Finally, this literature review will examine the shortcomings in anti-human trafficking initiatives and how impact evaluation fills the gaps.

DEFINITION

Impact evaluation as anti-human trafficking evaluation to measure their rigour in accurately measuring the success of anti-tracking initiatives (Davy, 2016). Impact evaluation is defined in the literature as the assessment of the effectiveness of anti-trafficking policies. Impact evaluation is the analysis of an intervention and how it affects outcomes. An impact evaluation assesses whether these

effects were intended or unintended. Impact evaluation informs us of alternate outcomes of the absence of the intervention (OECD 2012).

METHODS

The methods used in each study is through word searching and analyzing each policy and program put in place. Many studies have used in-depth interviews, whereas others have utilized government policies and case studies to draw conclusions on impact evaluation. The research findings bridge the effects of impact evaluation on policymaking. Specifically, highlighting the relationship between impact evaluation and the effectiveness of a policy reaching the intended demographic. Each work in this review includes the keywords “impact evaluation” and “anti-human trafficking policies.”

WHY IS IMPACT EVALUATION IMPORTANT FOR HUMAN TRAFFICKING POLICIES?

Certain factors can make one susceptible to human trafficking; economic and political instability, illiteracy, low food production, and high infant mortality rates (Davy, 2016). Victims of trafficking are subjected to a wide range of physical, psychological, and emotional health consequences (Davy, 2016). Each country has its own definition of human trafficking, which makes it challenging to collect data internationally. There are many frameworks that countries have in place to combat trafficking; an example of this is the 3 P’s paradigm (Davy, 2016). Specifically, the United States has three P’s; prevention, protection, and persecution. Prevention serves as a mode of awareness and targeting vulnerable communities at risk for trafficking (Davy, 2016). Protection is the recovery and reintegration of victims re-entering society. Persecution includes support for the implementation of legislation and policies to protect victims of trafficking, whereas other countries focus on the rehabilitation of victims.

Impact evaluation serves as a mode of analysis to the effectiveness of policies, campaigns, and initiatives. Precisely, the findings suggest that organizations are struggling to demonstrate urgency,

impact, and discern to combat human trafficking (Bryant & Landman, 2020), as well as some campaigns, eroticize migrant victims of trafficking. Therefore, these campaigns do not reach the right demographics and enforce stereotypes on to victims of trafficking. Impact evaluation fills the gaps needed to provide support to victims of trafficking. Supplementary findings suggest that anti-human trafficking policies, initiatives, and campaigns create a victim paradigm that limits the support for marginalized communities to receive support (Fehrenbacher et al., 2020).

Furthermore, the findings propose that impact evaluation can provide an essential tool in creating effective programming, campaigns, and initiatives that aim to combat human trafficking. An example of this is, some studies have found that anti-human trafficking services lack urgency. Therefore, these services do not reach a broad demographic, while other services lack inclusion and do not reach transgender, migrant, and indigenous communities. Thus, the relationship between impact evaluations can assess anti-human trafficking services to change the impact of each service. The findings recommend that impact evaluation is an essential frame of analysis to combat human trafficking.

IMPACT EVALUATION AND THE VICTIM PARADIGM LIMITATIONS

The findings suggest that campaigns, policies, and initiatives create a victim paradigm that criminalizes those who fall outside of the paradigm. As a result, this limits the demographics that receive support. An example of this is from a case study that focuses on trans exclusion (Fehrenbacher et al., 2020). The findings suggest that trans victims of trafficking are criminalized and disregarded as victims (Fehrenbacher et al., 2020). Additionally, many women who have been trafficked are charged and are unable to seek citizenship or refugee status due to this criminalization. Therefore, trans & migrant women have varying factors that subject them to sex work, through job discrimination, poverty, and other facets of identity that would put them in a vulnerable position. Explicitly, many of these women are pushed into trafficking due to vulnerability and the lack of support from anti-human trafficking

resources/policies. Impact evaluation assesses how these policies exclude women by creating the victim paradigm. Thus, proving the effectiveness of these policies, campaigns, and initiative which aim to centre victims.

Case Study: Cindy Gladue

In 2011, Cindy Gladue, an indigenous woman, was murdered in a hotel bathtub in Edmonton, Alberta (Ranzack, 2016). At the time, Gladue was working as a sex-worker due to circumstances (Ranzack, 2016). However, she had engaged in a sexual exchange with Bradley Barton, a white man who was working as a trucker (Ranzack, 2016). Due to the evident sexual violence inflicted on Gladue's body, Barton was tried for murder (Ranzack, 2016). He claimed that he had initiated in rough sex with Gladue and had left her to bleed out in the bathtub (Ranzack, 2016). Although the evidence pointed to Barton murdering Gladue, he was not convicted for this crime. Sherene Ranzack argues that this is due to indigenous women being rendered disposable. Various studies have found that indigenous women are drawn into sex work out of circumstances rather than choice.

Furthermore, a field study finds that many migrant/trans women are criminalized for engaging in sex work. An example of this comes from Ana, a 25-year-old migrant transwoman who has "served a year in federal prison and 17 months in immigration detention after she was arrested in an FBI anti-trafficking "raid and rescue" operation" (Fehrenbacher et al., 2020). Ana states, "I hope I will be able to stay on that [T Visa], but it is still hard because my criminal record isn't clean. I still have convictions for the things I was forced to do on my record. I did not know that these could be taken away" (Fehrenbacher et al, 2020). Many studies have found a common victim paradigm that is a white, female, and young adult. In contrast, the lived reality of trans, migrant, indigenous women continue to be missed in these initiatives and campaigns. Many of these migrant, indigenous, and trans women are criminalized or rendered disposable like Gladue.

Inadequacies

The most crucial inadequacy with impact evaluation is the lack of numerical evidence of how effective these initiatives are (Davy, 2016). In contrast, most studies lacked sources of data available to track the effectiveness of anti-human trafficking policies (Caneppele & Mancuso, 2012). Although impact evaluation is a crucial step towards creating more inclusive policies, it is difficult to track due to definitions of human trafficking. Specifically, each country has its own definitions attributed to trafficking, and they vary depending on the country. Additionally, some countries consider Trans & migrant women as criminals, which further excludes these demographics (Fehrenbacher et al., 2020). Another finding suggests that those organizations are struggling to demonstrate urgency, impact, and discern to combat human trafficking.

Besides, there was a conflating of prostitution with human trafficking, as the majority of the campaigns focused on combating sex trafficking, which further blurs the lines between sex work and trafficking (Szablewska & Kubacki, 2018). Finally, another deficiency of these campaigns is the sexualisation of trafficking victims through orientalism and the erotization of migrant women (Szablewska & Kubacki, 2018). Through the eroticization of trafficking victims, these services become less effective. Thus, impact evaluation serves as a mode of assessment to create areas of improvement.

CONCLUSION

Although many countries are implementing anti-human trafficking policies, initiatives, and campaigns, there is no numerical measurement on the effectiveness to combat human trafficking. Impact evaluation serves as a mode of analysis for effective policies. This literature's relationship with human trafficking will help understand the exclusion that exists within policies. However, many victims of trafficking were not interviewed, nor are they given a chance to share their stories. Additionally, there

must be more work centering trans and migrant victims of trafficking due to this exclusion. An example of this is the fact that there are only four works of literature that review trans/migrant trafficking, one which interviews trans/migrant victims of trafficking. Impact evaluation can ultimately be the tool to shift the victim paradigm and find ways to reach larger demographics in need of support.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Caneppele, S., & Mancuso, M. (2012). Are Protection Policies for Human Trafficking Victims Effective? An Analysis of the Italian Case. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 19(3), 259–273. Doi: 10.1007/s10610-012-9188-9
- Bryant, K., & Landman, T. (2020). Combatting Human Trafficking since Palermo: What Do We Know About What Works? *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 1–22. Doi: 10.1080/23322705.2020.1690097
- Chambers, R. (2015). Inclusive Rigour for Complexity. *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 7(3), 327–335. Doi: 0.1080/19439342.2015.1068356
- Davy, D. (2016). Anti-Human Trafficking Interventions. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 37(4), 486–504. Doi: 10.1177/1098214016630615
- Fehrenbacher, A. E., Musto, J., Hoefinger, H., Mai, N., Macioti, P., Giametta, C., & Bennachie, C. (2020). Transgender People and Human Trafficking: Intersectional Exclusion of Transgender Migrants and People of Color from Anti-trafficking Protection in the United States. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 1–13. Doi: 10.1080/23322705.2020.1690116
- Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD-DAC, 2012)
- Picciotto, R. (2014). Is Impact Evaluation Evaluation? *The European Journal of Development Research*, 26(1), 31–38. Doi: 10.1057/ejdr.2013.44
- Razack, S. H. (2016). Gendering Disposability. *Canadian Journal of Women & the Law*, 28(2), 285–307. <https://doi-org.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/10.3138/cjwl.28.2.285>
- Scott, J., Ingram, A. M., Nemer, S. L., & Crowley, D. M. (2019). Evidence-Based Human Trafficking Policy: Opportunities to Invest in Trauma-Informed Strategies. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 64(3-4), 348–358. Doi: 10.1002/ajcp.12394
- Szablewska, N., & Kubacki, K. (2018). Anti-Human Trafficking Campaigns: A Systematic Literature Review. *Social Marketing Quarterly*, 24(2), 104–122. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1524500418771611>